



**Sindh Union Council and Community Economic Strengthening Support (SUCCESS)  
Programme – RSPN Component**

Fourth Interim Narrative Report (October 2018-September 2019)

Submitted to:

**European Union Delegation to Pakistan**

Submitted by:

**Rural Support Programmes Network (RSPN)**

3rd Floor, IRM Complex, Plot # 7, Sunrise Avenue (off Park Road),  
Near COMSATS University, Islamabad, Pakistan  
Phone: +92-51-8491270-99; Fax: +92-51-8351791  
Website: [www.rspn.org](http://www.rspn.org); [www.success.org.pk](http://www.success.org.pk)  
Facebook: [www.facebook.com/successprogramme](https://www.facebook.com/successprogramme)

**November, 2019**

**(Version 1 – 15.11.2019)**

## Contents

<b>Acronyms</b> .....	<b>3</b>
<b>1. Description</b> .....	<b>4</b>
<b>2. Assessment of Implementation of Action activities</b> .....	<b>5</b>
<b>2.1. Executive summary of the Action</b> .....	<b>5</b>
ER 1: SUCCESS Programme delivery, efficiency and impact measured and reported timely .....	15
ER 2: SUCCESS programme implementation methodologies and processes standardised across the partner RSPs, in order to guarantee quality, coherence and improvements .....	19
ER3: Evidence from the work of RSPs and rural communities generated and lessons documented.....	21
ER4: Evidence based recommendations advocated with stakeholders, including policy makers, donors, development community, to scale up successful community development approaches within the country and beyond .....	29
<b>3. Beneficiaries/affiliated entities and other Cooperation</b> .....	<b>41</b>
<b>4. Visibility</b> .....	<b>46</b>
<b>Annex – 1: List of Means of Verification</b> .....	<b>47</b>
<b>Annex – 2: Draft Sustainability Strategy of SUCCESS</b> .....	<b>51</b>
<b>Annex – 3: Action Plan on SUCCESS MTR Recommendations</b> .....	<b>60</b>

## Acronyms

AAP	Accelerated Action Plan for Reduction of Stunting & Malnourishment
CAT	Community Awareness Toolkit
CDD	Community Driven Development
CDLD	Community Driven Local Development
CI	Community Institutions
CIF	Community Investment Fund
CO	Community Organisation
CMST	Community Management Skills Training
CPI	Community Physical Infrastructure
CRP	Community Resource Person
EPM	External Performance Monitoring
EU	European Union
FACE	Forum for Advancement of Communication Expertise
FACT	Finance, Audit and Compliance Team
GoS	Government of Sindh
GRG	Gender Resource Group
JDC	Joint Development Committee
KPI	Key Performance Indicators
IGG	Income Generating Grant
IMI	Institutional Maturity Index
LMST	Leadership and Management Skills Training
LSO	Local Support Organisation
M&E	Monitoring and Evaluation
MERG	Monitoring & Evaluation Resource Group
MHI	Micro Health Insurance
MIP	Micro Investment Plan
MIS	Management Information System
MTR	Mid Term Review
NRSP	National Rural Support Programme
PAP	Population Association of Pakistan
PIM	Programme Implementation Manual
PINS	Programme for Improved Nutrition in Sindh
PODA	Potohar Organisation for Development Advocacy
PPRP	Peoples Poverty Reduction Programme
PRS	Poverty Reduction Strategy
PSC	Poverty Scorecard
RSP	Rural Support Programme
RSPN	Rural Support Programmes Network
SMRT	Social Mobilisation Resource Team
SRSO	Sindh Rural Support Organisation
SSRG	Social Sector Resource Group
SUCCESS	Sindh Union Council and Economic Strengthening Support
TA	Technical Assistance
TRDP	Thardeep Rural Development Programme
TVST	Technical and Vocational Skills Training
UCBPRP	Union Council Based Poverty Reduction Programme
UCDP	Union Council Development Plan
VDP	Village Development Plan
VO	Village Organisation
WISE	Water, Immunisation, Sanitation and Education
YDP	Young Development Professional

## 1. Description

This document outlines the progress made by the Rural Support Programmes Network (RSPN) from October 2018 to September 2019 in the implementation of the European Union (EU) funded “Sindh Union Council and Community Economic Strengthening Support (SUCCESS) Programme – RSPN Component”. Section 1 gives a summary of the programme. Section 2 starts with an executive summary, reviews progress on activities and key achievements to-date and presents work plan for the year, while Section 3 highlights the relationship between beneficiaries/affiliated entities and other cooperation, and Section 4 reports on whether visibility of the EU is being ensured in the programme.

1.1	Name of Coordinator of the grant:	Rural Support Programmes Network (RSPN)
1.2	Name and title of the Contact person	Khaleel Ahmed Tetlay, Chief Operating Officer, RSPN
1.3	Name of Beneficiaries and affiliated	Beneficiaries: National Rural Support Programme (NRSP), Sindh Rural Support Organisation (SRSO), Thardeep Rural Development Programme (TRDP), Government of Sindh (GoS)
1.4	Title of the action	Sindh Union Council and Community Economic Strengthening Support (SUCCESS) Programme RSPN Component
1.5	Contract Number	DCI-ASIE/2015/364-599
1.6	Start date and end date of the reporting period	October 1, 2019 –September 30, 2019
1.7	Target country(ies) or region(s):	Pakistan, Sindh
1.8	Final beneficiaries &/or target groups <sup>1</sup> (if different) (including numbers of women and men):	Target Group: SUCCESS partner Rural Support Programmes (NRSP, SRSO and TRDP), Government of Sindh and District Governments. Final Beneficiaries: People and people’s organisations benefiting from the SUCCESS Programme: 770,000 households, 307 LSOs, 3,240 VOs and 32,400 COs.
1.9	Country(ies) in which the activities take place (if different from 1.7):	N/A

<sup>1</sup> “Target groups” are the groups/entities who will be directly positively affected by the project at the Project Purpose level, and “final beneficiaries” are those who will benefit from the project in the long term at the level of the society or sector at large.

## 2. Assessment of Implementation of Action activities

### 2.1. Executive summary of the Action

The Specific Objective of the SUCCESS Programme's RSPN component is to promote a common approach in programme design, implementation, and the standardisation of processes to ensure that the programme delivery is efficient and effective. On purpose, this executive summary focuses on major challenges per result faced in the reporting period, notable issues, corrective actions and future pathways.

To achieve ER 1, '*SUCCESS programme delivery, efficiency and impact measured and reported timely*', RSPN continues to support RSPs on SUCCESS interventions. The first Institutional Maturity Index (IMI) Survey, assessed the health of Community Institutions (CIs) in the SUCCESS programme and showed that each of the three CIs had less than 50% maturity. As part of the corrective action, the Specialist Social Mobilisation RSPN carried out review meetings with RSPs field teams in October and November 2018, and developed an action plan for follow-up actions. The action plan agreed by the RSPs included translating the IMI survey questionnaire into Sindhi, capacity building of the Community Resources Persons and community leaders in organising regular meetings of CIs and efficient record keeping, and motivating CIs to mobilise local resources for sustainability of these institutions. The second IMI Survey commenced in July 2019 and is currently underway. The final report and analysis will be finalised in the next reporting period. The report will present the results of the IIMI survey that covers all the 312 LSOs formed and one VO and CO randomly selected within each LSO – thus the overall sample includes a total of 936 CIs comprising of 312 LSOs, 312 VOs and 312 COs from the eight programme districts of the SUCCESS programme.

During the last year, RSPN in collaboration with the M&E teams of RSPs also conducted a self-evaluation of the programme before the start of the SUCCESS Mid Term Review (MTR). The self-evaluation first aimed at preparing a document that helps the MTR team in understanding the design of the programme, its achievements with respect to the MTR's evaluation criteria, analysis of issues and challenges in implementation and proposed changes for the remaining period of the programme. Secondly, self-evaluation is considered as a best practice for self-learning and course correction.

RSPN in collaboration with NRSP conducted a follow-up sample Poverty Score Card (PSC) survey of those beneficiaries who have completed one year of their receiving Community Investment Fund (CIF) loans and Income Generating Grants (IGG). The findings showed that for CIF, out of the 191 sample households, 121 (63%) moved to a higher PSC Score Band, 58 (31%) remained in the same PSC Score Band, and 12 (6%) moved to lower PSC Score Band. While, for IGG out of the 21 sample households, 80% moved to a higher PSC Score Band and 20% remained in the same PSC Score Band. Around 36% of CIF and IGG beneficiaries in the sample have moved out of the 0-23 PSC score band.

Another key development with regards to ER 1 was effective employment of Management Information System (MIS) to track and report on the Key Performance Indicators (KPIs) of the overall SUCCESS programme. The MIS data has been shared with the Government of Sindh's Accelerated Action Plan for Reduction of Stunting and Malnutrition (AAP) and the EU's Programme for Improving Nutrition in Sindh (PINS) to use for targeting purposes. The MIS is regularly updated and upgraded according to the information needs of the management and our stakeholders.

During the last year the SUCCESS MTR, External Performance Monitoring (EPM) Mission and Impact Evaluation of the UCBPRP were launched by EU. The RSPN SUCCESS team facilitated these missions with provision of documents, arranging meetings with key stakeholders, communities and provided extensive feedback on reports produced by the

consultants at various stage of these evaluations. The recommendations of the MTR and EPM reports were discussed in detail by RSPN and the respective RSPs at the RSPN Board, management and field team levels. A detailed action plan was prepared and shared for further deliberation and proposed changes in the programme. Some of the main recommendations included linking TVST to market-based opportunities, addressing barriers to female empowerment such as adult literacy, and reformulating the approach of social mobilisation by making it more targeted. The SUCCESS team felt that remodelling social mobilisation was not practical and not relevant given the programme design, progress made and lack of evidence. The RSPs agreed to revise the TVST component and include the adult literacy component given the implication on the target group. An action plan addressing the recommendations was shared with the EU. The action plan coincided with the External Performance Monitoring (EPM) evaluation that commenced on 15 March, 2019 and presented its final interim report in July, 2019. The EPM recommended strengthening capacity building interventions for CIs by organising follow-up trainings and exposure visits, and reducing CPI targets since it did not seem practical. SUCCESS Programme Managers from the RSPs discussed the findings with the RSPN SUCCESS team and top management to establish a coordinated response and understanding of the recommendations. A detailed proposal (including revising TVST and incorporating an adult literacy programme) is being prepared and is in the final stage, it will be shared with EU in October 2019. The addition of the adult literacy programme and redesigning the TVST component and its implementation will require a no-cost extension of one year to the programme implementation period.

With regards to ER 2, '*SUCCESS programme implementation methodologies and process standardised across the partner RSPs, in order to guarantee quality and improvements*', the RSPN team has also been performing regular quality control spot check visits in randomly selected intervention areas and providing feedback for course corrections during the implementation of the SUCCESS programme. Social mobilisation activities such as the formation of CO/VO/LSO remained on track in terms of targets as well as the quality of processes being followed in mobilising the rural poor. 575,926 households (94% against the target) are organised into 29,321 COs (91% of target), 3,384 VOs (99.7% of target) and 312 LSOs (99% of target). The mobilisation and coverage of households increased by 10%, COs fostered by almost 7%, VOs fostered by almost 6% and LSOs fostered by 13% in the last year. After resolving the issue of opening bank accounts for Community Institutions, household interventions such as IGG and CIF disbursement has picked up progress in all three RSPs in the past year. The achievements of the interventions against their targets are given below:

**CIF:** Rs. 1,279 million against target of Rs. 1,452 million (88%), CIF sub grants have been transferred to 484 Community Institutions against target of 1,568 i.e. 31%. A total of 68,076 against a target 107,000 households have taken CIF (64%) loans. 82% of the beneficiaries invested CIF in livestock, 8% in small village level enterprises and 10% in agriculture inputs. *During the last year the CIF sub-granting increased by 99%, with the total amount disbursed to poor households by Community Institutions increasing by 312%.*

**IGG:** 24,601 (43% of the target) women from the poorest households got Income Generating Grants from their VOs and LSOs. 90% of the beneficiaries invested in livestock, 7% in small village level enterprises and 3% in agriculture inputs. A total of Rs. 569 million (66%) have been sub-granted to VOs and LSOs. *During the last year the amount of IGG sub-granting increased thrice as much (359%) to LSOs and VOs. The disbursement to beneficiaries increased by more than 7 times (769%), increasing the number of beneficiaries benefitting by more than 8 times (839%).*

*A key challenge in the disbursement of CIF and IGG, however, has been large number of poor households with limited volume of CIF and IGG amounts available with LSOs. The current amount of CIF and IGG will only benefit maximum 40% of the poor households (with PSC 0-*

23) during the programme period. Additional resources need to be invested in CIF in order to reach all the poor households.

**CPI:** 1,019 (49%) CPI schemes against target of 2,094 have been initiated and 446 CPIs have been completed. By the end of September 2019, an estimated 42,375 households (83%) have benefitted from CPI schemes, such as small link roads, street pavements and water supply projects. In the last year, there has been significant increase in the number of CPIs initiated at 143% and completed at 351%.

**MHI:** 128,064 poorest households (97% of the target) with 879,422 people were insured under the Micro Health Insurance component to help reduce household health expenditures and provide access to health services (hospitalisation). A total of 8,851 patients have been treated with an amount of Rs. 129 million (46% claim ratio) so far. The claim ratio has increased from 29% to 46% during the last year. Out of these MHI claims, approximately 80% are gynaecology and pregnancy related.

**TVST:** 16,231 people (88% of them women) have been trained in various Technical and Vocational Skills Training. The overall progress is slow, 22% of the targets set for the year ending at 2020 have been met. After review of the initial batch of TVST beneficiaries and dialogue with communities, additional trades have been introduced. However, due to mobility constraints especially for women and limited market for jobs and businesses in the local communities and districts the choices of trades made by target group are still limited at village and district level. Nevertheless, the progress over the last year, increased from 4,786 to 16,231 (239% increase) people trained in TVST. However, as recommended by MTR, the logframe targets for the TVST are still too high and needs to be revised. A proposal is being developed to redesign the TVST component with a focus on creating market linkages, enterprise, value chain development and revising the total targets. The new strategy will be implemented once approved from EU in the coming months.

Notable developments with respect to ER 3, ‘Evidence from the work of RSPs and rural communities generated and lessons documented’, include a new study on “Pathways to Social and Economic Empowerment of Rural Women through the SUCCESS Programme”, and research studies on Joint Development Committees (JDCs) and Micro Health Insurance (MHI) utilisation that were disseminated at the Policy and Advocacy Dialogue on August 07, 2019, in Karachi, Pakistan.

The study on “Pathways to Social and Economic Empowerment of Rural Women through the SUCCESS Programme” assessed three aspects of women’s empowerment, namely, social empowerment, economic empowerment and politico-legal empowerment by examining several indicators qualitatively at three levels – household (personal), relational (community) and societal (broader) across all the Community Institutions of SUCCESS. It was noted while assessing social empowerment that the all-women nature of CIs was one of the most significant factors in men’s consideration for consenting to women’s participation in various meetings, which allowed for greater access to banks, markets, medical facilities and their children’s schools, among other services. Findings on economic empowerment determined that women’s incomes increased as a result of CIF loans and IGGs, which led to greater recognition enhancing their access to and control over productive assets. Political empowerment was determined by witnessing increased women’s involvement in the realm of politics and local government that brought about significant changes in the feudal and traditional context of the project area.

Considering the findings of the report, government officials and policy experts such as Syeda Shehla Raza (Sindh Minister for Women Development), Nuzhat Shirin (Chairperson, Sindh Commission on the Status of Women) and Dr Asma Hyder (Associate Professor, Institute of Business Administration) discussed ways of ensuring women empowerment as panellists at

the Policy and Advocacy Dialogue. Inspired by the discussion, Minister Shehla Raza announced forming a group of all female Members of Provincial Assembly (MPAs) of Sindh Assembly to pick districts in Sindh to oversee human development programmes being implemented and report on the progress.

The study on JDCs titled “Challenges to Citizen-Driven Local Governance: Lessons from Pakistan”, considered the 41 JDCs formed at the Taluka and district levels under the SUCCESS programme. The research indicated that JDCs are in its initial stage and there is a long way to make them effective. The study recommended an amendment in the Rules of Business and/or departmental policies and procedures to provide supplies and services of line departments through Community Institutions. There needed to be amendments in the district budget making rules and process to include needs identified by Community Institutions through Village Development Plans, and Union Council Development Plans. It also recommended to develop a minimum core unit of RSPs staffed with District Manager, Monitoring Officer and accountant in each district and two social mobilisers in each field unit of the district to facilitate linkages with government departments and monitor Community Institutions after the closure of the SUCCESS programme. The Technical Assistance team while working on the PRS and CDLD road map for implementation may consider the recommendations.

Experts on local governance such as Dr Shereen Mustafa Narejo (Secretary, Planning and Development Department, Sindh), Mr Arshad Rashid (Development Advisor for Local Governance to Delegation of the European Union to Pakistan), Dr Kaiser Bengali (Ernst & Young) and Dr Abid Mehmood (Research Fellow, Cardiff University) discussed the impact of JDCs and recommendations to improve it. It was unanimously felt that JDCs could achieve its objectives by improving the quality of dialogues in the sessions.

The MHI study titled “Availability does not Mean Utilisation: Challenges and Enablers to the Utilisation of Micro-Health Insurance in SUCCESS programme” focused on identifying key enablers and challenges in utilisation of the MHI cards. The key challenges in low utilisation of the MHI cards included (a) long distances and location of panel hospitals, (b) lack of awareness and unclear mechanism about transport cost coverage, (c) low literacy rate, superstitious misnomer and fallacy of cash cards, and (d) undelivered cards due to migration and invalid CNICs. Recommendations for RSPs and RSPN included increasing targeted awareness among card holders on the use of MHI cards especially in low coverage areas. There needs to be greater support to link card holder households who do not have identity cards with the relevant government authority. In order to increase awareness, the RSPN SUCCESS component started a media campaign on MHI utilisation on local TV cable networks in all eight programme districts. For the insurance company the recommendation included: to devise a clear mechanism for payment of transportation costs and increase the coverage of panel hospitals (at least one in each Taluka). A meeting of the Programme Manager SUCCESS RSPN with insurance company’s management took place on April 13, 2019. They agreed to provide transportation cost of Rs. 300 for those travelling from within the Taluka, and Rs. 800 for those travelling from outside the Taluka to the panel hospitals. The decision is now being implemented.

The health insurance study was discussed and shared at the Policy and Advocacy Dialogue in August with over 150 stakeholders. Health insurance experts such as Dr Sonia Riaz, (Deputy Director, Prime Minister’s National Health Programme); Dr Shehla Zaidi (Director, Health Policy & Management Section, Aga Khan University); Saima Zafar (Jubilee General Insurance); Dr Faisal Abbas (Research Fellow, Gottingen University, Germany) weighed in on the policy recommendations at the panel discussion.

Progress through extensive outreach and scaling up of its engagement with multiple stakeholders to achieve ER 4, *‘Evidence based recommendations advocated and*



*communicated with stakeholders, including policy makers, donors, and development community, to recommend/promote successful community development approaches within the country and beyond*’, continued in year four of the programme. Communication mix products including short human-interest stories continued to highlight SUCCESS interventions on social media and newspaper articles in print media. To build on media engagement, SUCCESS began a series of media advocacy sessions this year in September. Journalists from national and local Sindhi TV channels were introduced to SUCCESS, with robust conversations on discussing issues in development reporting, and sourcing of data on development indicators. These sessions will continue into the next reporting period. Additionally, “micro videos” have been planned on the contribution of SUCCESS to Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) to enhance digital content.

Among other notable activities that led to deeper reflection and engagement of the stakeholders were a cultural event and lesson learning visits. The SUCCESS programme collaborated with the Lahooti Melo 2019, at Sindh University, Jamshoro. As a female empowerment programme, this year’s theme “an ode to a liberated woman” attracted the SUCCESS programme to the festival, as the team felt the objectives were similarly aligned.

A delegation of representatives of RSPs, district government, local elected representatives, technical partners and independent media observers undertook a lesson learning and experience sharing workshop in Hyderabad, Tando Muhammad Khan and Tando Allahyar on 20 February, 2019.

An exposure visit was also arranged in Skardu and Gilgit in April 2019 as well. Representatives of NRSP, TRDP, SRSO, RSPN, and Government of Sindh officials from districts Sujawal, Kambar Shahdadkot and Dadu met with CIs fostered by the Aga Khan Rural Support Programme (AKRSP). The objective of this specific exposure and learning visit was to observe and understand the ways in which AKRSP, the first RSP set up in Pakistan, is contributing towards improving the lives of rural communities in Gilgit-Baltistan and Chitral through a well-planned out Community Driven Development (CDD) approach. The delegation also attended the two day AKRSP Local Support Organisation Convention 2019 in Gilgit.

RSPN also develop a sustainability strategy paper in consultation with RSPs senior management and Board members of RSPN (Annex 2). The document highlights that the SUCCESS programme design incorporates several aspects of sustainability, including financial, institutional, policy level and environmental. The RSPs need to provide limited but ongoing technical support to continue similar work (effective linkages of Community Institutions with government line departments, capacity building of CIs to articulate their developmental priorities, monitoring of the CIF), for which they would need a sustainability fund/grant. At the community level, the most important factor for financial sustainability is CIF, which will be used by Community Institutions as a revolving fund to provide continuing financial support to members of COs. For infrastructure projects, a mechanism is in place to ensure that CIs have sufficient funds for the operation and maintenance of completed schemes.

Under the SUCCESS Technical Assistance component, in year four the Government of Sindh formally approved the Poverty Reduction Strategy (PRS) and the Community Driven Local Development (CDLD) policy. RSPN works closely with the TA team, bringing field-level knowledge and recommendations on how CIs formed under the SUCCESS programme can be used by government line departments as a conduit to improve public services to the poor.

The past year saw an impressive improvement in the implementation of the programme interventions and have provided opportunities for the SUCCESS programme, RSPN and the implementing partners, learning lessons from the challenges, successes, and best practices. With advocacy events and communications products underway, an even more successful year lies ahead.

## 2.2 Outcomes, Expected Results and associated Activities

Progress on the key outcome indicators under the specific objective of the programme logframe of the RSPN component is as following:

### **Indicator 1** *A common implementation approach and methodology adopted by all the SUCCESS implementing partner RSPs:*

All three partner RSPs have adopted a common implementation approach and are following the implementation methodologies outlined in the Programme Implementation Manual (PIM), the Monitoring & Evaluation framework, Community Awareness Toolkit (CAT), and associated tools developed in year 1 and reported in the First Interim Report (MoV-1). These manuals and associated tools that were developed proved to be instrumental in harmonisation of the programme implementation across the three partners.

**Indicator 2** *Percentage of project outputs, which are reported as achieved, or on track:* The overall project outputs are being continuously tracked through an online MIS dashboard, issues discussed and follow up actions undertaken through quarterly progress review meetings and regular monitoring visits by the RSPN/RSPs M&E teams in the field. A snapshot of the progress as of September 2019 against the targets of year 4, ending January 2020 on key performance indicators is presented below:

**Social mobilisation:** 575,926 households (94% against the target) are organised into 29,321 COs (91% of target), 3,384 VOs (99.7% of target) and 312 LSOs (99% of target). SRSO achieved only 80% of the COs targeted for the year. There was not any further significant variation in other achievements of the RSPs. The number of households' coverage increased by 10%, COs fostered by almost 7%, VOs fostered by almost 6% and LSOs fostered by 13% in the last year. Out of the total 575,926 organised households 71% are from the poor category (PSC 0-23) and the average membership of COs is 19 households.

*At the design stage of SUCCESS, the total rural households were estimated at 1,098,866. However, the Poverty Scorecard Survey (census) at the start of the programme found a total of 849,812 households – 23% less than the estimated households<sup>2</sup>. The target is to mobilise 70% of the total rural households. Based on the actual survey data, the target for households to be mobilised needs to be revised in the logframe from 770,000 to 594,868 households.*

**Notification of Community Institutions and status of bank accounts:** Overall 98% of VOs and 100% of LSOs have received notifications from the district authorities (Deputy Commissioners) in favour of the VOs and LSOs formed as of September 2019. During the last year the VOs notifications increased by 14% and LSOs notification increased by 31%.

Overall 72% of VOs have opened their bank accounts with a higher proportion of VOs (97%) in NRSP and lower proportion of VOs (54%) in TRDP. However, overall 100% LSOs have successfully opened bank accounts in all the programme areas. As the VOs bank accounts were very low during the last year more efforts were put at different level by the RSPs on opening of bank accounts of VOs which increased by 110% and 36% for the LSOs in the last year.

**Community Trainings:** This includes Community Management Skills Training (CMST) for office bearers of COs, Leadership Management Skills Training (LMST) for office bearers of VOs and LSOs, training of Community Resource Persons (CRPs) and Activists Workshops. Overall achievements against targets as of January 2020 ranges from 100% for LMST to 85%

<sup>2</sup>Before the PSC survey, the data of the total rural households was based on the 2010 Benazir Income Support Programme (BISP) data from where the projections were estimated at 1,098,866. However, during the actual survey which concluded with 20% less households than estimated it was found that some of the households had migrated to other districts over time, while a large number of households were now also categorised as urban town rather than rural union councils after reclassification of towns and union councils by the government in 2015. It is also noted that there was an issue of household splitting in the BISP data which may have inflated the total number of rural households.

for CMSTs. SRSO needs to improve progress on training CRPs (65%) and community bookkeepers (48%); NRSP and TRDP are on track.

**Programme Interventions:** The implementation of Community Investment Fund (CIF), Income Generating Grants (IGGs), Micro Health Insurance (MHI), Technical and Vocational Skills Training (TVST) and Community Physical Infrastructure (CPI) have shown significant progress during the last year with the resolution of the bank account issues.

**CIF:** Rs. 1,279 million against target of Rs. 1,452 million (88%), CIF sub grants have been transferred to 310 Local Support Organisations against target of 313 i.e. 99%. A total of 68,076 against a target 107,000 CO member households have taken CIF (64%) loans. 82% of the beneficiaries invested CIF loans in livestock, 8% in small village level enterprises and 10% in agriculture inputs. Over the last year the CIF sub-granting increased by 99% and number of beneficiaries increased by 252% as shown in Table 1.

Table 1: Progress of CIF sub-granting, disbursement and beneficiaries

KPIs	Progress as of:		
	Sept. 30,2018	Sept. 30,2019	% change in the last year
Number of LSOs managing CIF	178	310	74%
Number of VOs managing CIF <sup>a</sup>	106	174	64%
Total amount of CIF sub-granted to LSOs/VOs (PKR in million)	642	1,279	99%
Total amount of CIF disbursed to poor HHs by LSOs/VOs (PKR in million)	265	1,093	312%
Number of HHs benefiting from CIF	19,348	68,076	252%

<sup>a</sup> CIF is mainly sub granted at LSO level but SRSO also sub grants CIF at VO level

**IGG:** 24,601 (43% of the target) women CO members from the poorest households got income generating grants from their VOs and LSOs. 90% of the beneficiaries invested IGG grants in livestock, 7% in small village level enterprises and 3% in agriculture inputs. A total of Rs. 569 million (66%) have been sub-granted to VOs and LSOs. During the last year the amount IGG sub-granting increased by three times, disbursement to beneficiaries increased by seven times while number of beneficiaries increased by more than eight times. Details are presented in Table 2.

Table 2: Progress of IGG sub-granting, disbursement and beneficiaries

KPIs	Progress as of:		
	Sept. 30,2018	Sept. 30,2019	% change in the last year
Number of LSOs managing IGG sub-grants <sup>a</sup>	32	73	128
Number of VOs managing IGG sub-grants	398	2,000	403
Total amount of IGG sub-granted to LSOs/VOs (PKR in million)	124	569	359
Total amount of IGG sub-grants disbursed to poorest households (PKR in million)	42	365	769
Number of households benefiting from IGGs	2,619	24,601	839

<sup>a</sup> IGG is mainly sub-granted at VO level, however, SRSO also sub-grants IGG at LSO level

**CPI:** 1,019 (49%) CPIs against target of 2,094 have been initiated and 446 CPIs have been completed. An estimated total of 42,375 households are benefiting from completed CPI schemes. CPI schemes include small link roads, street pavement and water supply projects. The last year also saw a significant increase in the number of CPIs initiated (143%) and completed (351%) (Table 3).

Table 3: Progress of Community Physical Infrastructure Projects

KPIs	Progress as of:		
	Sept. 30,2018	Sept. 30,2019	% change in the last year
Number of CPIs initiated	419	1,019	143
Number of CPIs completed	99	446	351
Number of households benefiting from CPIs	10,475	42,375	305
Total cost of CPIs completed (PKR in million)	39	174	346

The CIF, IGG, and CPI are sub-granted to Community Institutions. As a requirement of the project, Community Institutions can only get sub-grants once these institutions are registered/notified by the government authorities and have institutional bank accounts. The opening of bank accounts took almost 2.5 years to be streamlined due to bank regulations and other issues with local bank branches (details of the issues and efforts to solve them have been reported in the 3rd Interim Narrative Report [MoV-10](#)). The bank issue has been resolved and thus the progress in implementation of the sub-granting showed significant progress in the last year.

**MHI:** 128,064 poorest CO member households (97% of target) with 879,422 people were insured under the Micro Health Insurance component. The MHI provides coverage of Rs. 25,000 per family member per year for inpatient hospitalisation costs. It helps reduce household health expenditures and provide access to health services. A total of 8,851 patients have been treated with an amount of Rs. 129 million (46% claim ratio) so far. Out of these MHI claims approximately 80% are gynaecology and pregnancy related.

**TVST:** 16,231 people (88% of them women) have been trained in various technical and vocational skills training. The overall progress is slow, 22% of the targets set for the year ending in 2020 have been met. In the first year the procurement process of service providers for vocational training took more time than expected. The TVST component was also slowed down by the management after review of the initial batch of TVST beneficiaries. The initial assessment showed that most of the women beneficiaries opted for traditional and basic trades (e.g. tailoring) which has limited marketability in the villages. The progress was slowed down to review and undertake dialogue with communities and market actors to diversify the training trades. Another key issue is in the design of TVST where the target is too high and cost per trainee is too low. After the review and dialogues with communities some additional trades have been introduced, however, due to mobility constraints especially for women, limited market for jobs and business opportunities in the local districts, the choices of trades made by target group are still limited at village and district level. Nevertheless, the progress over the last year increased from 4,786 to 16,231 people trained in TVST.

As recommended by the MTR, RSPs are in the process of redesigning the TVST component with more focus on creating market linkages, enterprise and value chain development, increased duration, and reduced targets. A proposal is being developed and will be shared with EU for approval in the month of October 2019.

**Joint Development Committees (JDCs):** All partners have successfully facilitated forming all the 41 targeted Joint Development Committees at Taluka and District levels. 62 (34%) meetings have been held as of September 2019, which is 114% higher over the last reported in September 2018.

The idea of JDCs is an innovative platform for building linkages among the line departments and Community Institutions. The objective of JDCs, as stated in the Financing Agreement, is “to advocate for access to essential public services and for planning, implementation and monitoring of local development plans”. JDCs at the district and Taluka levels in SUCCESS include representatives of government departments, local government, Community Institutions, RSPs and civil society organisations. The JDCs are notified by Deputy Commissioners; they are chaired by the Deputy Commissioner at the district level and the Assistant Commissioner at the Taluka level.

Part of the efficacy of the JDCs depends on the initiative of these chairpersons, who have wide-ranging and time-consuming administrative responsibilities and limited (and sometimes uncertain) tenures in office. Moreover, the district and Taluka heads of line departments that are responsible for service delivery do not report to these administrative officials and work according to their departmental rules rather than ad hoc instructions from the civil administration. The departments work with RSPs and Community Institutions after signing district-level Memoranda of Understanding (MOUs) with respective RSPs for undertaking specific activities in collaboration with the respective RSPs is however instrumental.

RSPN’s research shows that the JDCs, are yet in its initial stage and there is a long way to make them effective in the stated objective (MoV-19a). The key challenge on the part of government is how to include the community needs in the annual development planning process of the government. The existing Rules of Business for government departments does not include participation of Community Institutions in development planning and implementation process. The second issue is the ownership of Community Institutions as an official partner in development. The third issue is limited human and financial capacity of line departments to engage with CIs. Though the Poverty Reduction Strategy and CDLD policy is approved by the Government of Sindh, it should adopt the JDC model of SUCCESS to all the districts of the province but there is a limited awareness about this document and policy at the district level. To make the JDCs effective, following are the key recommendations:

- Amendment in the Rules of Business and/or departmental policies and procedures to provide supplies and services of line departments through the Community Institutions;
- Amendments in the district budget making rules and process to include needs identified by Community Institutions through Village Development Plans (VDPs), and Union Council Development Plans (UCDPs);
- Selection of sectors and departments considered appropriate for partnership with CIs and RSPs;
- Identification of activities eligible for the proposed modality (or activities excluded from it);
- Adequate (possibly enhanced) resource allocation for priority sectors and departments;
- A minimum core unit of RSPs staffed with District Manager, Monitoring Officer and accountant in each district and two Social Mobilisers in each field unit of the district is needed for facilitating linkages with government departments and monitoring Community Institutions after the closure of SUCCESS, as part of the sustainability plan. Resources would be needed for this core district unit.

The Technical Assistance team while working on the PRS and CDLD road map for implementation may consider the above recommendations.

For the RSPs, the JDC meetings have led to recognition and trust building of RSPs and Community Institutions with the government line departments and support in implementation of SUCCESS and other projects. It has also helped in notifying the CIs that facilitated in opening their bank accounts and access SUCCESS resources. However, the key challenge for the RSPs remains continuous orientation of the frequently changing government officials about the concept of JDCs and need of community participation in the development process.

For the communities, the JDCs have been appreciated by the representatives of the Local Support Organisations (LSOs) as a forum that elevates them as equal and powerful to engage those in power. One research participant said, “It was unbelievable for us to sit alongside high officials such as Deputy and Assistant Commissioners. This made us realise that we have gained power.” The key challenge for the women representatives of LSOs who are mostly not literate and from poor households is to assert the communities’ needs and demands in the male dominated powerful committees. To improve the demand side, which is represented by the Community Institutions and the RSPs, so that it can elicit a minimum set of services from selected government departments, it is important to consider the following points in coming years:

- Regular capacity building of LSO representatives in developing and updating their VDPs/UCDPs and advocating and articulating these needs at the JDC meetings
- Training community representatives as the village-level extension agents of line departments, who would be supported by community members who benefit from their services
- Regular interaction with and orientation/exposure visits for JDC members to the Community Institutions and their initiatives
- Paying the operational costs of incremental government support for additional outreach among the rural poor in the long run post project

**Indicator 3 *Level of satisfaction of SUCCESS Programme partners with RSPN's contribution in identified areas:***

The partner RSPs have shown high level of satisfaction with RSPN's contribution in the design of the programme, support in standardisation of approaches, communication of the work to wider audience and regular supporting supervision during programme implementation. This was evident from the second annual evaluation report of the SUCCESS component published in the first half of third year. The second external evaluation report ranked the programme overall at 4 on a scale of 1 to 5, signifying major strengths of the approach, good design feature, and high quality of results delivered and adopted by implementing partners (MoV-2). The annual evaluation activity for the third and fourth years, however, was not carried out because the Mid-Term Review (MTR) was contracted by the EU to an external evaluator this year.

The MTR team sent an inception report in December 2018 and included an assessment of the RSPN component. The MTR team then conducted a theory of change workshop on 6 and 7 February 2019 in Karachi that included all the RSPs, TA team and community LSO members. Considering the theory of change, field visits were carried out by the MTR team in March 2019, providing their intermediary field notes to the SUCCESS team. The final report was provided by end of June 2019 (MoV-3). The MTR found that key results were largely on track to being achieved by the completion of the programme and that social mobilisation had been impressive. The MTR Survey found increased income of beneficiaries (of the three interventions IGG, CIF and TVST), however, they felt the increases were not sufficient to bring households across the poverty line. Some of the main recommendations included linking

TVST to market-based opportunities, address barriers to female empowerment such as adult literacy, and to reformulate the approach of social mobilisation by making it more targeted.

The recommendations were considered by the SUCCESS team at RSPN and respective RSPs. The RSPN SUCCESS team, heads of RSPs and RSPN discussed the recommendations at the Sixth Oversight Committee and a subsequent meeting in detail on 27 and 28 June 2019. A more detailed action plan was prepared by the SUCCESS programme implementing partner leads. The SUCCESS team felt that remodelling social mobilisation was not practical and not relevant given the programme design, progress made and lack of evidence. The RSPs agreed to revise the TVST component and include an adult literacy component given the implication on the target group in addition to other recommendations on various components of the SUCCESS programme. The action plan regarding the MTR recommendations was shared with EU for their feedback in July 2019 and revised in September based on the EU's feedback (Annex - 3). The action plan will be shared with EU with proposals for an additional component of Adult Literacy and redesigning the TVST component in October 2019.

The action plan coincided with the External Performance Monitoring (EPM) evaluation that commenced on 15 March, 2019 and presented its final Interim report in July, 2019. The EPM recommended strengthening capacity building interventions for CIs by organising follow-up trainings and exposure visits, and reducing CPI targets since it did not seem practical (MoV-4). SUCCESS Programme Managers from the RSPs discussed the findings with the RSPN SUCCESS team and top management to establish a coordinated response. Considering recommendations from both MTR and EPM, a more detailed proposal (including revising TVST and incorporating an adult literacy programme) are being developed.

## Activities and Expected Results

### Start-up project activities:

The RSPN component of the SUCCESS programme has four expected results, with respective indicators, and corresponding activities to achieve them. The start-up activities were planned and completed in year one. The First Interim Report included detailed progress on these activities (MoV-1). In year three a new activity was added as "RSPN SUCCESS Programme Staff training/exposure/participation in conferences" in order to respond to staff capacity building. In the first half of year 4 the Administration and Procurement Officer SUCCESS attended a four-days training on procurement in Institute of Business Administration (IBA), Karachi.

### Expected Results:

#### ER 1: SUCCESS Programme delivery, efficiency and impact measured and reported timely

##### *Logframe Indicators:*

- 1.1. A common approach for undertaking baselines by the implementing RSPs by end of the six months.
- 1.2. A common M&E framework for the programme developed by end of the first six months.
- 1.3. Annual Key Performance Indicators (KPIs) report published by RSPN on behalf of SUCCESS RSPs.

The first two indicators of ER 1 have been achieved in the first year of the programme and have been reported in the First Interim Report (MoV-1). With respect to indicator 1.3, Annual Key Performance Indicators (KPIs) reports for the first and second year have been published

and disseminated widely among all relevant stakeholders. The third year KPI report is pending EU approval, it will be printed next year.

### **Activities:**

The following activities have been completed in the first year and detailed progress have been reported in the First Interim Report ([MoV-1](#)).

*A1.1. Development of common approach with RSPs for undertaking the baselines (methodology, indicators, targets, processes, etc.) for the SUCCESS Programme;*

*A1.2. Development of a common M&E framework for the RSPs with key performance indicators for the SUCCESS Programme*

*A1.3. Training of RSPs M&E staff on M&E framework and baseline approaches and methodologies and KPI reporting.*

Following activities under ER -1 are ongoing activities and progress in the year is presented here:

#### **A.1.4. Technical support to RSPs in implementation of the M&E framework**

Building upon last year's support extended by RSPN to the RSPs for implementation of the M&E framework, the M&E activities have focused on ensuring that the implementation of interventions is on track and promotes quality and coherence in the programme, through spot-check field visits, process monitoring and daily progress reports updated on the MIS dashboard.

RSPN core and RSPN SUCCESS technical and management team members undertake regular field visits which cover various aspects of the SUCCESS programme. The coverage includes, but is not limited to: the implementation of social mobilisation activities including programme introductions; formation of Community Organisations (COs), Village Organisations (VOs) and Local Support Organisations (LSOs); Community Management Skills Training (CMST), Leadership Management Skills Training (LMST), Community Awareness Toolkit (CAT) sessions; development of household level and village level development plans, and further roll out of household level interventions: Community Investment Fund (CIF), Income Generating Grants (IGG), Technical and Vocational Skills Training (TVST), Micro Health Insurance (MHI) and Community Physical Infrastructure (CPI), and progress review meetings in the field with RSP programme staff.

In addition, android based M&E tools were developed and provided to the RSPs' M&E team for monitoring of TVST, CIF, IGG and Community Institutions (IMI tool). The RSP's M&E team are using these tools for monitoring of the programme activities.

During the last year RSPN in collaboration with the M&E team of RSPs also conducted a self-evaluation of the programme before the start of the MTR. The self-evaluation first aimed at preparing a document that helps the MTR team in understanding the design of the programme, its achievements with respect to the MTR's evaluation criteria, analysis of issues and challenges in implementation and proposed changes for the remaining period of the programme. Secondly, self-evaluation is considered as a best practice for self-learning and course correction. The self-evaluation report was shared with the MTR team and the report is available on the RSPN website ([MoV-5](#)).

Supervision and support is also provided to RSP staff through field visits for spot checks, post verification of activities, facilitation in process monitoring, as and when required, and technical



support in implementation of programme activities. During 2018, RSPN in collaboration with RSPs M&E team conducted the first Institutional Maturity sample survey of Community Institutions. The survey findings were shared in the 3rd Interim Report and the Institutional Maturity Index (IMI) report is now available on the SUCCES website ([MoV-6](#)). As follow up on the finding of the IMI survey the Social Mobilisation Specialist of RSPN conducted workshop and meetings with the RSP field team to improve areas of weakness in institutional capacity of CIs identified in the IMI survey ([MoV-7](#)).

The second Institutional Maturity Index (IMI) exercise commenced with a preliminary action plan meeting on 10 July, 2019 and is currently underway. Lessons were learnt from the previous IMI survey by translating the survey questionnaire into the local language (Sindhi) and hiring Young Development Professionals (YDPs) to assist in the survey. The fieldwork for the survey is expected to be completed by end of October, 2019. The team consists of an M&E officer based at the district level and an YDP. These teams are supervised by the M&E Managers at the respective RSPs.

The previous Institutional Maturity Index (IMI) data collection tools were updated by the RSPN M&E team, in consultation with the implementing partner RSPs as well as the participating RSPs of resource group meetings. The tool includes 14 indicators for COs, 18 indicators for VO and 17 indicators for LSOs (depending on their functions). On the basis of the response, an institution is then allocated score on a four-point scale (0-3). For each type of Community Institution, the scores on their respective indicators are then summed to give each Community Institution an Institutional Development Score. With a scale from zero to three for each indicator, the maximum possible result is 42 for CO, 51 for VO and 54 for LSO. Scoring levels were classified as: Below 25% (D); 25% to 50% (C); 50% to 75% (B); over 75% (A).

The final report and analysis will be finalised in the next reporting period. The report will present the results of the Institutional Maturity Index (IMI) survey that is covering a total of 936 Community Institutions. These include all the 312 LSOs and a randomly selected one VO and one CO from each LSO, making a total of 312 VOs and 312 COs. The assessment of the Community Institutions will be analysed in terms of their organisational motivation, performance and capacity. In addition, the assessment will also look into the impact of external factors on the performance of the CIs.

Support was provided to the NRSP team in conducting a follow up PSC survey of CIF and IGG beneficiaries. This follow up survey included 191 CIF beneficiaries and 21 IGG beneficiaries who got their grants and funds one year ago. The results are shown below:

CIF beneficiaries: Out of the 191 households 121 (63%) moved to a higher PSC score band, 58 households (31%) remained in the same PSC band and 12 households (6%) moved to a lower PSC score band as compared to the baseline PSC survey.

IGG beneficiaries: Out of the 21 households in 0-11 PSC band, 17 (80%) moved to a higher band of PSC, 5 households moved to PSC 12-18, 6 households moved to PSC 19-23 and 6 households moved to PSC 24-34. However, 6 of the households remained in the same band of PSC 0-11.

Key factors in downwards movement in household poverty band:

- Nine households' score decreased due to change in household demography and change in dependency ratio score (increase in the household members less than 18 and over 65 years and change in household head education)
- Two households' score decreased due to increase in out of school children
- One household's score changed due to selling off TV

Key factors in upwards movement in household poverty band:

- 25 households' scores increased mainly due to demographic changes (dependency ratio decreased, household head education changed)
- 10 households' scores increased mainly due to improvement in social sector indicators (toilet, children's enrolment, etc.)
- And rest of the households' scores increased mainly due to changes in the households' assets including livestock, cooking stove, TV, room/household member ratio, etc.

In the next year the M&E team of RSPN plans to conduct an outcome assessment survey of CIF and IGG beneficiaries.

The last year also saw an extensive engagement of the SUCCESS team with the MTR team, External Performance Monitoring (EPM) mission and Impact Evaluation Team of the UCBPRP. This engagement included in facilitating the evaluation team in coordination of field activities, meetings of reference group, facilitation in theory of change workshop, facilitation for accessing information/documents and reviews, and feedback on the consultant's report at various stages.

Additionally, the EPM report found the SUCCESS M&E Framework comprehensive, providing detailed guidelines on what to monitor and how to track performance, as well as a detailed description of the evaluation scope. The EPM mission concluded that the M&E Framework includes the preparation of a common approach to undertaking the baselines (methodology, indicators, targets, processes and tools) to ensure that the programme is delivered efficiently and the implementation is measured and reported in a timely manner. However, they recommended including impact (outcome) and sustainability indicators for poverty reduction components in the M&E Framework.

#### ***A1.5. Annual reporting on common programme KPIs***

In order to report on the overall SUCCESS programme performance, a set of common Key Performance Indicators (KPIs) were developed for the overall SUCCESS programme in consultation with the implementing RSPs and were made part of the M&E framework. An online dashboard has also been developed, which provides real time data and tracks the progress on these KPIs. Upon completion of the third year of the RSPs component in Feb 2019, RSPN is meant to publish an annual report on the Key Performance Indicators (KPI) for 2018-19. The annual KPI report, in addition to reporting on the KPIs and achievements of the programme, also includes the work of all SUCCESS partners (GoS, RSPs, Technical Assistance component and Community Institutions) and donor (EU) in promoting the CDD approach in Sindh. The third KPI draft report 2018-19 has been completed since July 2019 and was sent for approval to the EU. A longer KPI report version will be available on our website, while a shorter version will be printed after EU's approval (**MoV-8**).

#### ***A1.6. Up-gradation and Maintenance of MIS/GIS mapping to track KPIs***

The Management Information System (MIS) has played a crucial role in tracking and reporting on the Key Performance Indicators (KPIs) of the overall SUCCESS programme. The online dashboard has a real-time user interface, showing a graphical presentation of the progress of 85 KPIs, which increased from 70 KPIs from last year on a daily basis. It is available publically at <http://mis.rspn.org/success>. The KPIs include indicators on social mobilisation as well as household interventions. The MIS also includes detailed results of the poverty scorecard survey data and data of Community Institutions and programme interventions. The MIS has been shared with the AAP programme of Government of Sindh and PINS programme of EU to use for targeting purposes. Researchers and development organisations can benefit from

these rich datasets. The MIS is regularly updated and upgraded according to the information needs of the management and our stakeholders.

**ER 2: SUCESSS programme implementation methodologies and processes standardised across the partner RSPs, in order to guarantee quality, coherence and improvements**

*Logframe Indicators:*

- 2.1. Similar Implementation Manual/Guidelines adopted by SUCCESS partner RSPs
- 2.2. Number of SUCCESS RSPs staff trained on Programme Implementation Manual
- 2.3. Quality Control Plan developed by RSPN and adopted by RSPs

The Programme Implementation Manual (PIM), quality control plan developed by RSPN at the start of the programme remained instrumental in order to standardise the implementation methodologies and process across the three RSPs. A total of 221 relevant programme implementation and management team members have been provided training on the PIM. RSPN is providing continuous supportive supervision to the RSPs for improvement wherever needed.

**Activities:**

The first five activities were completed under ER 2 in the first year and were reported in the First Interim Report ([MoV-1](#)). The following on-going activities continued in the fourth year of the programme. The detailed progress of second year was reported in the Second Interim Report ([MoV-9](#)) and the progress of the third year in the Third Interim Report ([MoV-10](#)). The progress for the fourth year is as follows:

#### ***A2.6. Supportive supervision and quality control spot check visits***

RSPN's technical and programme team have been conducting visits to the programme districts regularly. The purpose of these visits is to support the RSPs implementation team to ensure quality. During the reporting period the RSPN core and project staff members visited the NRSP, TRDP and SRSO programme districts where the programme activities are being implemented.

The team reviewed the implementation and monitoring process with the field teams, trainings conducted for field teams, community trainings, and conducted assessments and provided feedback to RSPs SUCCESS management and teams in the field and the Community Institutions members and leaders ([MoV-7](#)). The first Institutional Maturity Index (IMI) Survey, assessed Community Institutions (CIs) in the SUCCESS programme and showed that each of the three CIs had less than 50% maturity. As part of the corrective action, the Specialist Social Mobilisation RSPN carried out review meetings with RSPs field teams in October and November 2018, and developed an action plan for follow-up actions. The action plan agreed by the RSPs included translating the IMI survey questionnaire into Sindhi, capacity building of the Community Resources Persons and community leaders in organising regular meetings of CIs and efficient record keeping, and motivating CIs to mobilise local resources for sustainability of these institutions ([MoV-7](#)). These recommendations were taken into account for the second Institutional Maturity Index (IMI) Survey, which will be completed by end of October 2019.

The SUCCESS and RSPN Core team also carried out random quality control check on LSO meetings. Such randomised quality checks provide findings and recommendations to the project implementation team. Participating in an LSO meeting in Jamshoro on 11 February 2019, allowed for a lively discussion with the SUCCESS team at RSPN and TRDP representatives. Amongst various recommendations, it was suggested by the SUCCESS team

that at LSOs and VO monthly meeting, they must keep track of the progress and activities of their member COs. The LSOs should include all progress and activities carried out at the lower levels, functioning as a single organisation and consolidate its strength (MoV-7). The Social Mobilisation Specialist attended LSO meetings in Sujawal and Matiari to document LSO Initiatives. He found that the LSOs take up several development activities on their own, but do not document in their registers, which makes it hard to record these achievements. He recommended having the SUCCESS field staff assist LSOs to write down these activities in their registers for the record. He also recommended focusing upon the MIPs of the CO members and guide them to link their initiatives to their savings or government departments (MoV-7).

Spot checks have also been made by the RSPN SUCCESS team to oversee the data collection for the IMI exercise in all eight districts. Suggestions around time management and ensuring greater community participation in the discussions was emphasised.

### ***A2.7. Organising RSPs strategic support group meetings (SMRT, GRG, M&E, SSRG, FACT, and FACE)***

Through its RSPs sectoral resource groups including Social Mobilisation Resource Team (SMRT), Gender Resource Group (GRG), Social Sector Resource Group (SSRG), M&E Resource Group (MERG) and Finance, Audit and Compliance Team (FACT), Forum for Advancement of Communication Expertise (FACE), RSPN is providing technical support to all the partner RSPs. These resource groups are comprised of RSPs' sectoral heads/experts in their respective fields. The resource groups are internal practice communities and focus on a particular subject, which is usually an area of strategic interest and/or of operational interest to the RSPs. The purpose of these resource groups is to promote the practice of creating and developing indigenous knowledge, promote innovation and share knowledge that will aid and improve the delivery of RSPs' core functions.

During the reporting period, two meetings on SMRT were held on 15 March, 2019 and 26 August, 2019 (MoV-11, MoV-12). A joint meeting and training workshop of resource groups on project design was held on 13-14 March 2019 (MoV-13). This training workshop was organised in the context of building capacities of the RSPN Resource Groups, especially Monitoring & Evaluation Resource Group (MERG). A two-day FACE workshop was carried out in Lahore on 17-18 July, 2019 (MoV-14). A GRG meeting was held in Balochistan this year on 24-27 August, 2019 (MoV-15). Separate RSPs SSRG meetings and RSPs FACT meetings were dropped this reporting period.

### ***A2.8. Organising National LSO Conventions***

In order to promote the work of the Community Institutions fostered by the Rural Support Programmes (RSPs) across the country, and to advocate their work and achievements to a broader set of stakeholders, including policy makers, government authorities, donor agencies, and non-government organisations (NGOs), RSPN organises the Annual National Convention of LSOs every year. The Annual National Convention of LSOs for 2019 was held on 29<sup>th</sup> June, 2019 in Islamabad.

In the presence of relevant stakeholders, Mr Jean-François Cautain, Former Ambassador of the European Union to Pakistan, his wife Sonia Cautain; Mr Sartaj Aziz, Former Minister of Foreign Affairs; and Mr Shoaib Sultan Khan, Chairman RSPN advocated for the sustainability of Community Institutions in the country. The LSO Convention 2019 was able to achieve its objective successfully by providing a platform for voices that celebrate the achievements of LSOs to a far wider audience. The convention also proved to be an opportunity as a farewell to the Former Ambassador and his wife (MoV-16).

To complement the convention, a digital campaign, with live posts update on speakers and short interviews were shared on our digital platforms such as Facebook, Instagram, Twitter and the YouTube channel. On Facebook, the posts and videos uploads received 11,078 in reach and 1,096 in engagement.

### ER3: Evidence from the work of RSPs and rural communities generated and lessons documented

#### *Logframe Indicators:*

- 3.1. One action research Programme completed by end of the programme
- 3.2. Four thematic/sectoral studies and one synthesis report completed by end of the programme
- 3.3. SUCCESS Programme lesson learning visits and workshops

Evidence-based learning is critical to support and strengthen policy advocacy and continuous programme improvement. In the fourth year of the programme, RSPN has conducted the following major activities to achieve this result:

#### **A.3.1. Action research on poverty dynamics**

The research team at RSPN continues to collect, document, analyse, publish and disseminate insights about poverty dynamics. A quasi-experimental design of Randomised Control Trial (RCT) has been set up in two union councils of Tando Allahyar District. After the first socio-economic baseline survey (2016), the second survey will be launched in January 2020. As part of the research design, this survey is repeated with the randomly selected 2,300 households, to track changes in the socio-economic indicators of the households and overall household poverty dynamics. The research tools are reviewed and revised in collaboration with Dr Andreas Landmann (University of Mannheim, Germany) and Dr Waqar Wadho (Lahore School of Economics). A pre-analysis plan of the data is configured to further improve the RCT in the research UCs. This will allow the team to improve the data collection and questionnaire in the upcoming data wave in January 2020.

SUCCESS hired a survey firm named Fincon to carry out annual surveys in the research Union Councils. Data collection is complete and the firm has provided their analysis and draft report. The SUCCESS research team reviewed the Fincon report and survey data, providing its feedback and observations (MoV-17). It was noted that the survey firm had failed to follow the minimum data quality protocols. The firm was informed of its shortcomings during the course of the survey but it could not improve its performance. Keeping in view the severe data quality issues, the firm has been informed that RSPN would not continue further survey contracting with this firm. At the same time, the SUCCESS research team reviewed the RCT design in consultation with Dr Andreas Landmann and Dr Waqar Wadho (technical advisors to the research team) and decided to do away with annual data waves. It was also noted that the research plan did not suffer due to the failure of the firm to collect data because the programme roll-out was much slower than expected. The next round of data collection will be conducted in January 2020.

In order to understand the status of access to inpatient health insurance offered as part of the ongoing SUCCESS programme, a study was conducted by the research team titled "Availability does not Mean Utilisation: Challenges and Enablers to the Utilisation of Micro-Health Insurance in SUCCESS programme" (MoV-18a). The study was presented at the 5<sup>th</sup> RSPN Board Oversight Committee meeting on 15 March, 2019 and the 25<sup>th</sup> SMRT meeting on 26 August, 2019 with recommendations endorsed by the committee (MoV-12). Key findings and recommendations of the study include:

## Key Findings:

### Enablers:

- Highest instance of the MHI usage in Jamshoro showed that ease of access was a key enabler for the communities to benefit from MHI utilisation.
- The availability of MHI cards encouraged community members to access qualified doctors and rely less on quacks available nearby.
- Those who used cards have reported to have saved their critical assets such as livestock and avoided high-cost (both economic and social) borrowing from landlords and money lenders.
- MHI card has been used more than 60 percent in the cases related to gynaecology like delivery cases and more than 30 percent in the cases of serious viral infections like diarrhoea in children as a common disease.

### Challenges:

- Long distances and location of panel hospitals
- Lack of awareness and unclear mechanism about transport cost coverage
- Lack of functional coordination and clarity of roles between the RSPs and the insurance company
- Low literacy rate, superstitious misnomer and fallacy of cash cards
- Undelivered cards, migration and lack of CNICs

## Recommendations

### For RSPs/RSPN

- Increase targeted awareness among the card holders on use of MHI cards especially in low coverage area
- More awareness and support to link those households who either do not have a CNIC or have an expired one, with NADRA
- RSPN SUCCESS component to start a media campaign on MHI utilisation in radio and local TV cable

These recommendations were discussed at the RSPN Board's SUCCESS Oversight Committee and RSPs and RSPN agreed to implement them.

### For the Insurance Company

- Devise a clear mechanism for payment of transportation costs
- Increase the coverage of panel hospitals (at least one in each Taluka)

A meeting of the Programme Manager SUCCESS RSPN with insurance company's management took place on April 13, 2019 to discuss the recommendations of the study for the insurance company. They agreed to provide transportation cost of Rs. 300 for those travelling from within the Taluka, and Rs. 800 for those travelling from outside the Taluka to the panel hospitals.

A complimentary Micro Health Insurance policy brief was prepared by the research team lead to be utilised at the Policy and Advocacy Dialogue (MoV-18b). Health insurance experts such as Dr Sonia Riaz, (Deputy Director, Prime Minister's National Health Programme from the Ministry of National Health Services); Dr Shehla Zaidi (Director, Health Policy & Management Section, Aga Khan University); Saima Zafar (Jubilee General Insurance); Dr Faisal Abbas (Research Fellow, Gottingen University, Germany) weighed in on the policy recommendations from the brief and the panel discussion. Three major recommendations were discussed, firstly, at both the federal and provincial level, the design of insurance needs to be considered to remove misalignments of insurance provision. Secondly, the Government needs to deliberate on the quality of health facilities. Thirdly, the sustainability

of health insurance needs to be considered, which cannot be achieved through donors only such as in the case of SUCCESS (MoV-33).

The research team along with Dr Abid Mehmood (Cardiff University), carried out a study on JDCs titled “Challenges to Citizen-Driven Local Governance: Lessons from Pakistan”, that considered the 41 JDCs formed at the Taluka and district levels under the SUCCESS programme (MoV-19a). The research indicated that JDCs are yet in its initial stage and there is a long way to make them effective in the objective “to advocate for access to essential public services and for planning, implementation and monitoring of local development plans”. The study recommended an amendment in the Rules of Business and/or departmental policies and procedures to provide supplies and services of line departments through Community Institutions. There needed to be amendments in the district budget making rules and process to include needs identified by Community Institutions through Village Development Plans (VDPs), and Union Council Development Plans (UCDPs). It also recommended to develop a minimum core unit of RSPs staffed with District Manager, Monitoring Officer and accountant in each district and two social mobilisers in each field unit of the district to facilitate linkages with government departments and monitor Community Institutions after the closure of the SUCCESS programme. The Technical Assistance team while working on the PRS and CDLD road map for implementation may consider the recommendations.

The JDC study findings and recommendations were presented at the 25<sup>th</sup> SMRT meeting and the Policy and Advocacy Dialogue (MoV-12) (MoV-33). The research team lead prepared a similar policy brief that was utilised at both events (MoV-19b). Experts on local governance such as Dr Shereen Mustafa Narejo (Secretary, Planning and Development Department, Sindh), Mr Arshad Rashid (Development Advisor for Local Governance to Delegation of the European Union to Pakistan), Dr Kaiser Bengali (Ernst & Young) and Dr Abid Mehmood (Research Fellow, Sustainable Places Research Institute, School of Social Sciences, Cardiff University) discussed the impact of JDCs and recommendations to improve it. It was unanimously felt that JDCs could achieve its objectives by improving the quality of dialogues in the sessions. Clearly, the institutionalisation of local governance structures has not been an issue but the impact has been limited (MoV-33).

### **A 3.2. Conduct Thematic Sectoral Study 1**

Under the research component of SUCCESS, 4 thematic and sectoral studies and one syntheses report are to be carried out during the life of the programme. The first study topic is “Study on Pathways to Social and Economic Empowerment of Rural Women through the SUCCESS Programme” and it has been awarded to Enclude (consulting firm) through a competitive bidding process. This study will be in two rounds: first round started in 2018 and second round will take place in beginning of 2021. The first round of the study was completed during the last year. This study used a qualitative research approach, relying on 18 Focus Group Discussions, 30 in-depth interviews, 24 key informant interviews and one ethnographic study to collect data from 6 of the 8 SUCCESS districts. The approach for assessing women’s social, economic and political empowerment is summarised in Text Box 1. A summary of the findings are presented below:

#### **Text Box 1: Approach Adopted in the Women’s Empowerment Study of SUCCESS**

The study assessed three aspects of women’s empowerment, namely, social empowerment, economic empowerment and politico-legal empowerment. The study assessed these aspects by examining several indicators qualitatively at three levels – household (personal), relational (community) and societal (broader) across all the community institutions of SUCCESS. The indicators are:

- Social empowerment: autonomy, leadership, self-confidence, self-expression, gender roles, attitude shifts, decision making and behavioural changes.
- Economic empowerment: income, business practices, consumption patterns, prosperity and work environment.
- Political empowerment, information, communication, vertical accountability, recognition, representation and participation.

## Social Empowerment

1. By most accounts, the opportunity offered to women to organise created a dynamic in which the men in the family opposed the idea of women leaving their homes for community meetings. Restrictions on mobility also limited women's access to educational and health facilities as well as offices dealing with CNICs. The opposition was more intense when CO and VO leaders had to leave their hamlet or neighbourhood for meetings at the village and union council levels.
2. Women had to persuade and reassure men in different ways to negotiate for greater mobility. The Women's Empowerment Study notes that the all-women nature of Community Institutions was one of the most significant factors in the men's consideration for consenting to women's participation in various meetings. The tangible benefits of income generation also played a powerful role in the process of acceptance. After organising and overcoming obstacles, women reported greater access to banks, markets, medical facilities and their children's schools, among other services. More women have started cellular phones for updates, communication and connectivity.
3. The report adds, "Most women at VO and LSO levels have full support from their immediate family, and in most cases it is the family members (spouse, father, mother, brothers) who provide them protection, and shield them from cruel comments from surrounding communities."
4. Women's awareness of social issues and basic rights has increased as a result of greater exposure as well as the programme associated with CAT. According to the Women's Empowerment Study, "Many respondents were clear that they understood the significance of family planning and childbirth spacing, its role in women's health, and its contribution to family welfare and prosperity. They were equipped with the necessary information regarding mother-child healthcare, food and nutrition, cleanliness, hygiene and education".
5. "The women say that they feel more able to handle their chores, manage household expenses, and take decisions in their family matters only because they were able to complete infrastructure projects (paved roads, hand pumps and sewerage lines were few mentioned by our respondents) – conventionally dominated by men – on their own."

## Economic Empowerment

6. Women's incomes increased as a result of CIF loans and IGGs. Women used the increased incomes in different ways, including reinvesting in their businesses, purchase of consumer durables and improved diet for the family. They also spent more on education and health and some of their personal needs (such as small jewellery items, new clothes and shoes). Women's contributions and the resulting recognition enhanced their access to and control over productive assets. Their role in household economic decisions has also broadened to include decisions about setting up micro enterprises and purchasing and selling livestock.
7. "The very act of identifying, prioritising, and managing ... a community infrastructure scheme developed the CO and LSO members in meaningful ways. It has developed women's understanding of how community infrastructure, especially roads, are a must for a community to prosper and grow. According to the respondents, they were encouraged to take decisions by RSPs despite resistance from the community men, and applied for the CPI scheme." Women recognised the power of working together, and how unity, leadership, and management skills contributed to empowerment.

## Political Empowerment

8. There are two main aspects of political empowerment in the context of SUCCESS, one in the realm of politics and the other in local governance, as it affects service delivery. In relation to the former, "An absolute majority of [women] indicated that this was the first time in their life that they had participated in the [2018] elections". Women felt obliged to their



Community Institutions for assisting them in obtaining their CNICs and guiding them on the voting process. Moreover, several LSO presidents were approached by various candidates and their political allies for mobilising votes in their support. The involvement of women in politics in these ways is a significant development in the feudal and traditional context of the project area.

9. Organised women have used Community Institutions, especially the VOs and LSOs, to articulate their development issues and reach out to government departments for addressing them. At the same time, many government officials have recognised the value of working through VOs and LSOs. Progress has been evident in terms of obtaining birth certificates and CNICs, voter registration, school enrolment, family planning practices, deliveries arranged in hospitals, vaccination (including for polio), tree planting campaigns and livestock vaccination. These are not systemic changes but they are useful local initiatives in the space created by women's mobilisation.

The report was designed and edited by the SUCCESS team (MoV-20a). Findings of the report were shared in the RSPN Board meeting and the 24<sup>th</sup> SMRT meeting in March, 2019 (MoV-11). The report was officially launched and disseminated at the Policy and Advocacy Workshop on 7 August, 2019. The research team lead prepared a policy brief based on the study which was shared with the participants and panellists at the event (MoV-20b). Considering the study and policy brief, Ms Dureeshawar Mahmood (former co-investigator at Enclude), Ms Shahida (General Secretary Local Support Organisation, Sehikh Bhurkio in Tando Muhammad Khan), Syeda Shehla Raza (Sindh Minister for Women Development), Nuzhat Shirin (Chairperson, Sindh Commission on the Status of Women) and Dr. Asma Hyder (Associate Professor, Institute of Business Administration) discussed ways of ensuring women empowerment specifically in Sindh as panellists. Inspired by the discussion, Minister Shehla Raza announced forming a group of all female MPAs of Sindh Assembly to pick districts in Sindh to oversee human development programmes being implemented and report on the progress (MoV-33).

### **A 3.3. SUCCESS lessons learning visits and workshops**

A delegation of representatives of the National Rural Support Programme, Thardeep Rural Support Programme, Sindh Rural Support Organisation, Rural Support Programmes Network, P&D GoS, PPRP, district government, local elected representatives, technical partners - EY, IRM, SZABIST and independent media observers undertook an experience sharing and learning visit to Hyderabad, Tando Muhammad Khan and Tando Allahyar on 19-20 February, 2019 (MoV-21). There was significant local and national media traction on the event as reporters were a part of the delegation. The news articles are available on our website (MoV-22).

Summary of the key lessons and challenges presented at the workshop are:

#### **Successes to Highlight**

- The Government authorities at district level have been extremely supportive in timely registration/notification of CIs, which remained critical to start the sub-granting under the CIF and IGG interventions. The participation of Planning and Development Department, GoS in various workshops such as the Annual National Convention of LSOs and Experience Sharing and Learning Visit and Workshops ascertains the public sector support towards the programme.
- The presence of district administration and line department officials in activist workshops remained effective in establishing linkages and raising awareness on CAT issues. This helped the community to initiate self-help activities through the government line departments on education (school enrolment and opening closed schools), preparation of CNIC, registration of votes and health-related activities at

community level. Clearly effective linkages with stakeholders especially government departments and officials contribute to greater interventions in the community. However, frequent transfers of district officials DCs/ACs, makes it harder to sustain linkages with the government.

- The formation of JDCs has created and strengthened synergies between the RSPs and the local administration/departments. In Dadu and Jamshoro districts, these linkages have been bolstered after the line departments have been notified by the Deputy Commissioners (DC) to sign MoUs with the RSPs for further collaboration as this would lead to efficacy in getting communities' demands fulfilled. The participation of women members from the LSOs in JDCs is key to bring the CIs and government line department closer so that in future they could make effective linkages with the Community Institutions for providing services and supplies to the communities.
- MoUs with district Health Department, Education Department, Social Welfare Department, Agriculture and Livestock Departments have helped in fostering linkages between CIs and these Departments. A MoU has also been signed with SIAPEP (Sindh Irrigated Agriculture Productivity Enhancement Project) for the provision of kitchen gardening kits under NRSP. Other RSPs should strive to take up similar MoUs to support the programme.
- Water, Immunisation, Sanitation and Education (WISE) programme supplemented the SUCCESS programme interventions in district Tando Muhammad Khan by NRSP, contributing to improving social sector indicators and to the community institutional performance and maturity of the respective area. Clearly, integration of inter-project and intra-project interventions can increase effectiveness of the SUCCESS programme.
- The community managerial trainings have resulted in confidence building of community leaders. The development of training manuals in the local language with pictorial presentation and interactive sessions has remained effective in community and leadership managerial trainings as well as CAT sessions.
- The use of MIS has resulted in more transparent and accurate programme implementation. Strict real-time monitoring of data has reduced the risk of compromising the data quality. The availability of all the data including interventions, on a public dashboard speaks to the credibility and transparency of the programme.
- The development of household level MIPs, VDPs, and UCDPs has helped sensitise women towards the issues faced by community members and come up with effective solutions. These plans have also enabled the community members to start self-help initiatives which have included school enrolment, cleanliness of village drives, health related campaigns and activities such as polio drives, civic engagement such as getting CNICs and birth certificates made, and registering for voting in the elections.

### **Challenges; and steps to overcome them**

- Specific to micro health insurance, the unavailability of hospitals that meet the criteria to empanel at Taluka level has resulted in low coverage of MHI beneficiaries benefiting from MHI. The insurance company has been working on including as many hospitals as possible in their panel that meet the quality criteria.
- In household interventions such as CIF and IGG, some of the beneficiaries are migrating for labour work and this makes it difficult for the field teams to locate them during monitoring and verification visits. There is also a risk of the usage of IGG by beneficiaries for consumption purposes instead of income generating purposes as these are the poorest households. However, the field teams are vigilant and carry out strict monitoring of the beneficiary households regularly. Some of the intended potential beneficiaries who were willing to get CIF and IGG cannot avail the opportunity since their CNICs were expired/unavailable. Registering CNICs for community members should be a priority for the team.

- It has been identified by all implementing partners that the type of trade under the vocational training the women community members are willing to receive are very limited and focuses on tailoring and embroidery work, predominantly due issues of mobility, economic and cultural barriers to go out of the house and villages. Another challenge is that of limited employment opportunities for vocational training participants. For this, the implementing partner RSPs are reaching out to the markets, developing linkages as well as sensitising and encouraging trainees about market linkages. Additionally, the poorest households targeted are mainly labourers/farmers. It becomes difficult for them to take out time for TVST which can last around 30 days or more.
- There has been a high turn-over of engineering staff which has resulted in delays in the implementation of CPI schemes. Additionally, drinking water was the need identified by most communities. In most areas of the programme districts, the quality of water was not drinkable (as determined by the quality test) and water treatment was costly, making it difficult to implement such schemes in these villages. The RSPs and LSOs in the Joint Development Committees are advocating with local government to intervene and help the communities in providing clean drinking water.
- Literacy rates in the community especially for women is low in the programme districts. Finding literate community office bearers and CRPs has been challenging. However, this was tackled in some areas by amending the criteria of CRPs required and hiring the best possible local candidates on board of those available. Also, in certain cases, where women CRPs were not available, men have been hired. In some areas, certain CRPs engaged for multiple VOs or CRPs were paired (e.g. husband/wife) to overcome low literacy and unavailability of CRPs. In addition to this, as recommended by the MTR, a proposal will be submitted to the EU to include an adult literacy component in the programme, starting from next year.
- The government of Sindh declared drought in 35% Revenue Villages (RVs) (88 RVs in Dadu and 67 RVs in Jamshoro). This drought has led to migration of people in the community. One entire UC and 42 villages had restricted access due to security reasons in Jamshoro district. The field staff found it difficult to complete their targets in these areas.

#### ***A.3.4. Young Development Professionals (Research Associates)***

YDPs were engaged in the communication, documentation and research work of SUCCESS for a period varying from 3 – 6 months depending on individual YDP availabilities. The YDPs were expected to understand the approach of the SUCCESS programme (MoV-23) and learn the community driven development approach, helping them initiate a career in the development sector. Depending on the field of interest of the YDPs, three YDPs were attached with the knowledge management team, two YDPs with the communications team, and 11 YDPs with the M&E team. The YDPs under the knowledge management team successfully published eight booklets, documenting human interest stories from each district titled the “Echoes of SUCCESS” (MoV-24). The YDPs with the communications team supported in the development and dissemination of digital media content of the SUCCESS programme while the YDPs in M&E were engaged to assist the M&E team in conducting the IMI survey of Community Institutions.

#### ***A.3.5 Publication of Research Papers in Journals and Presentation in conferences - New activity added in year 4***

The research team actively endeavoured to share its research and evidence-based policy work with the national and international audience and hence responded to the various calls for research papers.

The Research Team Lead along with Dr Abid Mehmood delivered a talk on JDCs in the SUCCESS programme on 2 November, 2018 at the PLACE research seminar series titled “Bottom-link governance for sustainable development: Insights from a large-scale poverty reduction programme in Pakistan” at Cardiff University, United Kingdom (MoV-25). The talk was followed by a brief question-answer session, where most of the questions largely referred to clarifications about the aims and objectives of SUCCESS, role of JDCs, women’s participation and effectiveness of IMI. The Team Lead Researcher, co-authored a paper with Dr Abid of Cardiff University on the need for public policy reforms in (reproductive) health sector to address issues of access in remote and rural areas of the country. The paper titled “Reproductive health services: “Business-in-a-Box” as a model social innovation” was published in a prestigious international journal, namely Development in Practice (MoV-26).

Another study titled “Drivers of Empowerment for Rural Women: Insights from Rural Support Programmes in Sindh” was selected to be presented at the Lahore University of Management Sciences (LUMS), 2nd International Interdisciplinary Conference on “Gender, Work and Society: Bringing Together Feminist and Postcolonial Insights”. The study was presented by the SUCCESS research team on 27 April, 2019 in a session headed by the Chairperson of Punjab Commission on Status of Women. The study demonstrated the drivers, process and pathways to women empowerment in a rural context. It was shown as an example to design similar interventions elsewhere to build inclusive societies (MoV-27).

The study titled “The Relationship between Access to Land and Rural Poverty in Sindh Province of Pakistan: A Pathway out of Poverty” will be finalised in February 2020. It has been prepared in collaboration with the Centre for Global Studies, Shanghai University. The study examines the relationship between the landlords and the *haris* (landless farmers) and its impact on poverty (MoV-28).

Along with research papers, the research team lead also participated and gave talks on various topics related to rural development. This allowed for greater coverage in the public discourse beyond academia.

The research team lead presented his views and gave a talk at the “Rural Development and Industrialisation in Pakistan” organised by the Rural Development Foundation. He linked a popular topic such as the China-Pakistan Economic Corridor (CPEC) to rural development, bringing rural employment into the mainstream public discourse (MoV-29).

He also participated in a conference on the “Governance and Service Delivery in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (KP)” in the KP Provincial Assembly on 29 July, 2019. The conference aimed at the dissemination of policy relevant research. The conference included State Ministers of Finance, Local Government and Secretary KP Assembly. Participating in the conference allowed for the research lead to gain a better understanding of local governance in other provinces and form linkages to support the SUCCESS programme amongst development practitioners and politicians.

Reflecting on the living style of rural tenants of the research site in Tando Allahyar, the research team published an article titled “Tenants have no way out” in the leading English daily ‘The Dawn’ on January 21, 2019 (MoV-30). Additionally, in the same ‘The Dawn’ newspaper, the research team lead also published an article on the state of poverty in the rural regions of Pakistan titled “The rural face of poverty” on December 3, 2018 (MoV-31). This article suggested to the Federal Government and to the Government of Sindh to reduce urban bias in youth policies by creating employment and economic opportunities for the rural youth of Sindh. The article was based on the data collected during the SUCCESS programme.

ER4: Evidence based recommendations advocated with stakeholders, including policy makers, donors, development community, to scale up successful community development approaches within the country and beyond

*Logframe Indicators:*

- 4.1. Community Driven Local Development Approach reflected in number of donor and government programmes and projects
- 4.2. Number of Advocacy events undertaken
- 4.3. Number of Regional cooperation activities undertaken with organisations working in the regional countries

Advocacy and communications activities are an integral part of a programme. Multiple activities have been undertaken throughout the reporting period, which has advocated the efficacy and usefulness of the SUCCESS programme to various stakeholders at their respective levels. Some of the activities undertaken throughout the year have been reported below.

**Activities**

Some of the activities under ER 4 have been completed in the first year and reported in the First Interim Report ([MoV-1](#)):

**A4.1. SUCCESS Programme launching workshop:** Completed in year 1.

**A4.2. Development of communication and advocacy strategy:**

Keeping the importance of Communication and Visibility actions consistent, RSPN has developed a Global Communication and Visibility Plan for SUCCESS along with a detailed activity work plan for the duration of the programme. The EU approved the Global C&V plan on 22 February 2018. The now finalised plan is a result of various consultative meetings between the partners and EU communications team, and incorporates feedback from all relevant stakeholders ([MoV-32](#)).

In light of the approved C&V plan, RSPN communications team continues providing technical support to RSPs to align their work plans with the Global C&V plan for SUCCESS.

**A4.3. Advocacy Workshops with government and other stakeholders**

In order to provide evidence-based policy solutions and recommendations that can serve as a tool for advocacy with relevant stakeholders, in the last two years the SUCCESS programme carried out studies on micro health insurance, women empowerment and local governance respectively. The dissemination of the studies was carried out in a Policy and Advocacy Dialogue on Health, Local Governance and Women Empowerment on August 07, 2019, in Karachi, Pakistan.

Over 150 participants from development organisations, academia, civil society, media, the Federal Government and the Government of Sindh deliberated and reflected upon the lessons and experience that could be useful at the policy level pertaining to the three research topics. Experts and policy-makers such as Dr Sonia Riaz (Deputy Director, Prime Minister's National Health Programme), Ms Syeda Shehla Raza (Sindh Minister for Women Development) and Dr Shereen Mustafa Narejo (Secretary, Planning and Development Department, Sindh) championed policy recommendations from the studies and shared further insight ([MoV-33](#)).

On social media the policy and advocacy workshop enjoyed great popularity in terms of reach and engagement. It received 10,354 in reach and 786 in engagement.

The respective studies and panel discussions proposed recommendations found below:

### **Policy recommendations on micro-health insurance**

- RSPs and RSPN need to increase targeted awareness which can be achieved through a media campaign.
- Linkages or partnerships with government institutions such as National Database & Registration Authority (NADRA) need to be established by the RSPs to avoid the lack of CNICs
- Insurance companies (in this case Jubilee General Insurance) need to devise a clear mechanism for payment of transportation costs.
- Jubilee General Insurance needs to increase the coverage of panel hospitals (at least one in each Taluka) to increase access for beneficiaries.
- Governments need to develop partnerships with wider civil society to integrate health coverage in the ongoing poverty reduction programmes.
- Governments should also encourage private sector hospitals to function in rural areas, establishing a new market.
- The Government's own health coverage campaigns should cover transportation costs and include an awareness raising component.

### **Policy recommendations on women empowerment**

- RSPs need to link women of the community to resources available with other private entities and government departments.
- RSPs should consider adding topics related to gender based violence, conflict management, information and communication technologies (ICT) in Community Awareness Toolkit (CAT) sessions. These CAT sessions could also include an adult literacy classes for greater transparency and good governance.
- One of the important learning from the study is that Community Institutions must survive beyond the project period of SUCCESS, which must be considered by the government.
- The government needs to invest in safe transport to foster women mobility as the non-availability of public transport infrastructure has been a major impediment to women's social and economic empowerment.
- For the Government of Sindh, the SUCCESS programme is a scalable, replicable and transformable model to women's economic empowerment.

### **Policy recommendations on local governance**

- On the demand side the RSPs could arrange regular orientation, training and exposure visits for JDC members to enhance their understanding of CDLD and its potential.
- The RSPs need a programme for building the capacity of VOs and LSOs in advocating and articulating their plans and priorities at JDCs and with individual line departments.
- The RSPs should develop a mechanism for digitalising the village and union council development plans and updating them annually.
- On the supply side amendments in the Rules of Business and/or departmental policies and procedures should be made to provide supplies and services of line departments through CIs.
- Amendments in the district budget making rules and processes are required to include needs identified by CIs through VDPs and UCDPs.
- The chairpersons (Deputy Commissioners and Assistant Commissioners) may allow the JDCs to meet on their own on a regular basis, select a moderator for each meeting and provide the minutes of the meeting for vetting and formal approval by the chairperson.

- On a longer term basis, provision should be made for hiring and maintenance of minimum RSP core structure at district level for facilitating linkages with government departments as well as monitoring of CIs and CIF after the closure of SUCCESS.

#### **A4.4. Showcase of SUCCESS Programme interventions at cultural events**

In view of RSPN-SUCCESS's wide range of components, one of its key targets is to design diverse activities, which could highlight and bring forward the work undertaken by the rural communities of Sindh under the SUCCESS programme. Such events can generate a raft of benefits because they involve many different stakeholders. In light of this, the SUCCESS programme collaborated with the Lahooti Melo 2019, which took place on the 9th and 10th of February, at Sindh University, Jamshoro. The main theme this year was 'an ode to a liberated woman', which follows the momentum gaining the #MeToo movement, aimed against sexual harassment, violence against women and women empowerment. As a female empowerment programme, this year's theme attracted the SUCCESS programme to the festival, as the team felt the objectives were similarly aligned.

The two-day event showcased artefacts, handicrafts and food stalls from all over the nation, which included Sindh Rural Support Organisation's (SRSO) Sartyoon Sang as well. SUCCESS programme's publications including the Echoes series, LSO initiatives and newsletters were placed at the stall, that were distributed to young students, media personalities, social media influencers and academia. More than 10,000 people attended this cultural event.

Committed to women empowerment and dedicated to the #MeToo movement, the festival offered many talks and panel discussions all focused on women and prevalent issues that surround them. Prominent guests spoke at the Lahooti Melo 2019, including renowned authors/activists Amar Sindhu, Fouzia Saeed, Sindh Education Minister Syed Sardar Ali Shah, Pakistani singer/social worker Shehzad Roy, author Mohammad Hanif among others. The festival was marked with a number of power talks in between sessions of music, poetry and story-telling.

Along with the stall, the SUCCESS programme also held a power talk designed in the shape of a TED Talk on the second day of the festival, 10 February 2019. The talk titled "Empowering Rural Women Across Sindh" was given by one of SUCCESS programme's beneficiary, Irum Wahid, the president of her LSO in Union Council Chuhar Jamali, District Sujawal. She shared her experience and story, from fighting the stigma around the role of women in a community to fearlessly demanding development initiatives from government representatives to inspire the youth in the audience. She explained the importance of the SUCCESS programme and the impact it had on the women in her region. The talk concluded with an animated video of the components and objectives of the EU funded SUCCESS programme ([MoV-34](#)).

Extensive pre-event, on-day, and post-event media coverage was given to Lahooti Melo 2019. A live radio show was broadcasted all over Pakistan by FM 91 on both days of the event. The SUCCESS team and Lahooti Melo representatives gave detailed briefing about RSPN, SUCCESS, and the Lahooti Melo which was covered in multiple newspapers. On the day of the event, the media partners for the event were NewsOne, TVOne and FM91, providing coverage on all the activities of the event. Interviews of the organisers were taken by the radio channels and other mainstream electronic media channels including Geo News, The News International, Express Tribune and Dawn.

The SUCCESS team mainly promoted the event with hashtags #SUCCESSinSindh and #LahootiMelo2019 on Twitter and Instagram, starting on the week of the event. There was significant impressions and engagements on Twitter as a result of this promotion. In total,

tweets received 8,659 impressions and 213 engagements. The top tweet for the month February was regarding Lahooti Melo, with 1,638 impressions and 30 engagements.

#### ***A4.5. Collaboration for conferences on critical issues (women, education, health, sanitation)***

RSPN supported the 19<sup>th</sup> Annual Population Research Conference held on November 29-30, 2018 at the University of Peshawar, by collaborating with the Population Association of Pakistan (PAP). The theme of this year's conference was "Population and Development: Policy and Programme Implementation Challenges in Pakistan." The forum brought together population experts, health professionals, development sector partners, media persons, provincial government officials, private sector organisations, and civil society, hailing from different parts of the country, to contemplate topical population and development issues. Prominent speakers included Mr Javed Jabbar (Former Senator and Co-founder of Social Policy and Development Center), Colonel (retd.) Muhammad Hashim Dogar (Minister for Population Welfare, Government of Punjab), Mr Sardar Abdul Rehman Khetrani (Minister for Population Welfare and Science & Technology, Government of Balochistan) and Mr Asghar Ali Shah (Secretary Population Welfare KP).

The two-day event featured presentations on sector innovations, latest survey findings, and challenges on population planning and programming, delivered by prominent population experts, development practitioners. The conference provided a platform to discuss policy and implementation challenges of population and development agenda in Pakistan. It touched upon sub-themes that were in line with RSPN's objectives such as inequity in the development process with regional disparities; climate change and water scarcity; innovative approaches to stabilise population growth; and youth engagement for productive and marketable skills ([MoV-35](#)).

RSPN also collaborated on the Annual Conference on Rural Women Day in Pakistan with Potohar Organisation for Development Advocacy (PODA) held on October 15-16, 2018 in Islamabad. The conference is the largest networking event for rural women of Pakistan where over 2,000 women from over 100 districts interact with policymakers, donors and stakeholders from government, businesses, civil society, media and academia. This unique gathering provides rural women leaders to pass a resolution about women's economic, social and civil rights annually and report back on its implementation.

For 2018, the conference was based on the theme of 'Making Democracy Real for Rural Women and Girls' and aimed towards shedding light on Pakistan's progress and commitment on SDG 5 Gender Equality, and 'Planet 50:50 by 2030 - Step It Up for Gender Equality' that asks governments to make national commitments to address the challenges that are holding women and girls back from reaching their full potential.

A policy dialogue on 'Gender-Based Violence: Engaging Women Parliamentarians for Enhancing Access to Justice for Rural Women', that was dedicated to Pakistan's champion of human rights Asma Jahangir, featured NRSP's Manager for Gender and Development, Salma Khalid. Salma Khalid talked about NRSP's role in uplifting the status of 67 districts through socially mobilising men and women into communities.

At the event, RSPN also sponsored two policy dialogues with PODA, FAO, ADB and Sangtani. One of these titled "Rural Women, Water and Climate Change: Moving Towards Poverty Reduction" was dedicated to Tahira Ali Shah (1964-2015), a lifelong water rights and gender equality activist and founder of Noori Foundation, that works for collective rights of women fisher folk in Sindh. The other dialogue on "Economic Empowerment of Rural Women and Girls in Pakistan: Challenges and Opportunities" covered crucial aspects of rural women's role in the national economy.



At one of the sessions on political empowerment of rural women, LSO leader Farhana Shaikh from the SUCCESS programme based in Kambar Shahdadkot shared her experience on the community's effort in bringing rural women to the fore of political participation in rural areas. She also expressed her commitment to increase women's percentage of votes in the next elections ([MoV-36](#)).

This year RSPN plans to collaborate with PODA at the 12th Annual Conference on International Day of Rural Women. The event is scheduled for 15th to 17th October 2019 in Islamabad under the overall theme of "Synergising Rural Women's Leadership for Rights-Based Development in Pakistan". Unlike previous years, RSPN will host their own session at the PODA event for further coverage and exposure. The theme of the RSPN is titled as "Rural women taking charge through social mobilisation: successes, lessons learnt and challenges" and will have speakers from LSOs sharing their experiences.

#### **A.4.6. Regional experience sharing and learning visit**

The Regional Experience Sharing and Learning Visit to India was planned for the third year, however, due to visa issues it could not take place, and instead the visit location was changed to Tajikistan. The visit successfully took place from September 22, 2018, to October 3, 2018. During this visit, an 11-member Pakistan team visited Tajikistan for experience sharing and learning. The team included two representatives from the Planning and Development Department of Government of Sindh (including one representative from UCBRPP/PPRP), two representatives each from NRSP, TRDP, SRSO, and three from RSPN. The report was finalised and uploaded in this reporting period ([MoV-37](#)).

A blog prepared by the research team, documenting field observations of the Tajikistan visit, uploaded on the SUCCESS website ([MoV-38](#)). Additionally, an article on the reflections of the Tajikistan visit has been published by the research team in the "Daily Times" newspaper ([MoV-39](#)).

The next regional experience sharing and learning visit for year 4 was planned in September 2019 to the BRAC and Asian Development Bank (ADB) supported Poverty Graduation programme in the Philippines. This visit could not happen as the host organisation in the Philippines was committed to government and donor missions in September, hence, this event is now rescheduled for January 2020.

#### **A4.7 Implementing RSPs/RSPN staff, GoS staff and CRPs visit to other RSP Areas**

Exposure visits are planned under the SUCCESS programme to allow the participants to directly observe the work and learn from the experiences of the other RSPs in social mobilisation and social empowerment, and learn from active leaders of Community Institutions.

The exposure and learning visit for the fourth year took place in Skardu and Gilgit from 22-30 April, 2019. Representatives of NRSP, TRDP, SRSO, RSPN, and Government of Sindh officials from districts Sujawal, Kambar Shahdadkot and Dadu met with CIs fostered by the Aga Khan Rural Support Programme (AKRSP). The objective of this specific exposure and learning visit was to observe and understand the ways in which AKRSP, the first RSP set up in Pakistan, is contributing towards improving the lives of rural communities in Gilgit-Baltistan and Chitral through a well-planned out Community Driven Development (CDD) approach.

The delegation interacted with the beneficiaries of the AKRSP at the grass-root level and gained insights into how CIs work synergistically to trigger change at various levels. Given AKRSP's decades long involvement in women's economic empowerment, the delegation also conducted visits to multiple women-owned and women-led markets including the Hawa Market

and Kehkashan Market for females and the Sawera Training Centre. Agriculture being the mainstay of rural economy, AKRSP's strategic focus is to invest in and support the development of this sector. As such visits were conducted to Zaiban's Green House promoting climate resilient vegetables in the region, Akbar's Food Shop giving local farmers' products access to national and international markets, and Shazday Fruit and Farmers' Cooperative Society.

Following the successful completion of two days' field visit to Skardu, the delegation travelled to Gilgit and attended the two day AKRSP Local Support Organisation Convention 2019, where members of various LSOs shared their achievements and challenges with the intent to foster the development dialogue among major development stakeholders of the region.

During and after the visits, the participants shared their immediate and long-term take away to improve their work. Such reflections were noted and shared in the visit report ([MoV-40](#)).

Lessons learnt from the exposure visit included:

- Mobilisation of poor households into CIs has led to strengthening of social capital, poverty reduction and increase in household incomes
- Household members of the Community Institutions in Gilgit-Baltistan have accumulated millions of Rupees as savings starting from a single penny in 1982
- Development of human capital is the biggest success of AKRSP in the region
- Women Organisations (WOs) have provided a collective platform for women to prioritise, plan, and undertake self-managed development initiatives
- Development of social, human and financial capitals through Community Institutions has led to peace and increased tourism, creating greater economic opportunities in the region.

#### **A4.8. Annual RSPs Strategic Retreat**

The Annual RSPs' Strategic Retreat is organised to provide a platform for the Rural Support Programmes to share their experiences, review strategic aspects of RSPs' work, and reflect on the way forward to consolidate and enhance the efforts for poverty reduction through community driven development. The Retreat also acts as a forum for strategic coordination, experience sharing, networking, and highlighting of new initiatives of the RSPs and the Community Institutions. It provides opportunities to other donors to learn about the RSPs' social mobilisation approach and develop their interest to support this approach, and develop synergies between the programmes for RSPs and their own ongoing programmes.

In the current reporting period, RSPN hosted a two-day RSPs' Annual Strategy Retreat 2019 on 24-25 September, 2019 in Bhurban, Murree. This year's retreat was especially crucial in the context of the recently launched federal government's *Ehsaas* Programme. Chairman RSPN Mr Shoaib Sultan Khan emphasised on the outreach RSPs possess in reaching every household in Pakistan for socio-economic empowerment that offers value addition to the government's national initiatives.

The retreat was well-attended by representatives from four provincial governments and Azad Jammu and Kashmir (AJK) and Gilgit Baltistan (GB), community representatives, diplomats, donors and development practitioners, including the Additional Chief Secretary of Punjab Capt. (R) Aijaz Ahmad, Additional Chief Secretary AJK Dr. Syed Asif Hussain, and Deputy Head of Mission Mr Sigbjorn Tenfjord from the Royal Norwegian Embassy in Pakistan.

Panel discussions on important topics such as poverty graduation, rural development enterprise, and community paralegal programmes, led to opportunities of experience sharing and lessons learnt between participants. The presence of media, arranged by the SUCCESS

communication team, led to newspaper coverage in six national publications, including “The News”, “Dawn” and “The Nation”. This further amplified the challenges and lessons learnt from RSPs programmes and their contribution towards poverty graduation in the country ([MoV-41](#)).

#### ***A4.9. Communication Mix Products (Documentaries on SUCCESS Programme interventions, short human-interest stories, video infographics, jingle music videos, project presentations)***

The communication mix product includes a series of Human Interest Stories (SUCCESS Dairies), newspaper blogs/articles, video documentaries and photo stories.

To ensure timely and quality completion of the communication mix products, RSPN has engaged Black Box Sounds (BBS), a production house based in Islamabad to produce the specified number of products on an annual basis. The progress on the communication products is presented below:

- **SUCCESS Diaries:** These are short videos (3 – 5 minutes) on individual beneficiaries and aim to highlight the change that the SUCCESS programme has brought to the lives of the beneficiary. Four SUCCESS diaries are planned each year. During the reporting period, two SUCCESS diaries have been developed and disseminated on social media, completing the plan of producing four human diaries. These two diaries are based on the themes of Income Generating Grants and Micro Health Insurance ([MoV-42](#)). SUCCESS Diaries 01 and 02 of beneficiaries Nadia and Fareeda respectively were aired on eight local Sindhi cable networks, covering SUCCESS’ programme districts, except Matiari where local cable network was disabled due to technical reasons. A total of 150 insertions for each SUCCESS diary were aired for a spread over 15 days in December 2018 and January 2019. For the year 2019-2020, another four diaries have been planned looking into the impact the project has had on communities at the Village Organisation level ([MoV-43](#)). Production for these videos will begin in November 2019.
- **Blog Articles:** During the reporting period eight blog news and blog articles were published in major English, Urdu and Sindhi dailies such as Daily Times, The News, Sindh Express and Nawa-i-waqt. Seven blog articles were published in the previous year, bringing the overall total to 16 blog articles. The themes of the articles ranged from girls education, women empowerment and entrepreneurship to political identity and success stories covering sustainability efforts of beneficiaries ([MoV-44](#), [MoV-45](#), [MoV-46](#), [MoV-47](#), [MoV-48](#), [MoV-49](#), [MoV-50](#), [MoV-51](#)).
- **Photo Stories:** Four photo stories were to be developed and disseminated through SUCCESS digital media. Two of these stories were completed in the reporting period ([MoV-52](#), [MoV-53](#)). However, the other two were discontinued due to its low usage and replaced with social media posts.
- **Social Media Posts:** For the year 2019-2020, the photo stories product was discontinued, considering its low usage. It has been replaced instead with 40 designed social media posts from Blackbox Studios to improve digital visibility. From June 2019 to September 2019, 21 designed posts ranging from project branding, pre- and post-events coverage to international awareness days such as Global Contraception Day and International Peace Day were uploaded on SUCCESS social media platforms. The remaining 19 posts from Blackbox Studios will be dedicated to SUCCESS’ upcoming Annual KPI Report launch, and celebratory and awareness days falling in the calendar till December 2019. Additionally, SUCCESS team has also been self-creating posts to highlight success stories, project updates and impact throughout the year.

- **Music Video and Documentary:** A music video was produced in early 2018 for the SUCCESS Sindhi jingle. The video features the original SUCCESS jingle in both Sindhi and Urdu ([MoV-54a](#)), for wider public reach. The music video was aired on eight local Sindhi cable networks, covering SUCCESS' programme districts, except Matiari where local cable network was disabled due to technical reasons. A total of 180 insertions of the video was aired for a spread over 15 days in December 2018 and January 2019. A documentary projecting the SUCCESS programme's progress and impact over the last three years was planned for the year 2018 but due to delays in post-production, the product was finalised in June 2019 ([MoV-54b](#)).
- **Micro Videos:** To add to more digitally inclined content, a new product has been planned called 'micro videos' which follow 'AJ+' or 'Now This' style videos of 60-90 seconds. A total of five videos have been planned, based around the contribution of SUCCESS to Sustainable Development Goals, specifically Goal 1 (no poverty), Goal 2 (zero hunger), Goal 3 (good health and well-being for people), Goal 4 (quality education), Goal 6 (clean water and sanitation) and Goal 13 (climate action). Production of these videos will begin in November-December 2019.

#### ***A4.10. Bi-Annual SUCCESS Programme Newsletter***

The bi-annual newsletter features key achievements, progress, event reports, success stories and other relevant key information in one publication. In total, seven newsletters have already been published. During the reporting period, the 6<sup>th</sup> and 7<sup>th</sup> issues of the newsletter covering April 2018 - September 2018 ([MoV-55](#)) and October 2018 - March 2019 ([MoV-56a](#)) were prepared.

Considering changes in reading habits of consumers and shift of preferences towards digital content, a shortened version of the 7<sup>th</sup> newsletter issue with four pages was also produced. This shortened version was then printed and disseminated to relevant stakeholders ([MoV-56b](#)).

The newsletters focus on the implementation of the programme in the field and bring forth beneficiary stories of SUCCESS' interventions. Digital and print versions of each issue of SUCCESS are widely disseminated to all stakeholders, including government officials, particularly to advocate and highlight the programme and CDLD initiatives taken under it.

#### ***A4.11. Media Campaign (Radio and Print Media)***

Following on last year's 13-episode radio magazine programme, this year a radio drama was planned. However, the radio drama was replaced with the production and dissemination of an instructional video on the Micro Health Insurance (MHI) component of the programme after a need arose following SUCCESS research team's study on MHI. The study concluded that one of the key reasons of low utilisation of the MHI cards in programme districts was lack of awareness. SUCCESS contracted Mercury Transformations to produce a 5-minute instructional video that outlines purpose of the insurance scheme, and the steps involved from how to use the card, in what circumstances to use it and documents required to claim insurance. The video was aired on local cable TV in all eight districts from September 25<sup>th</sup> 2019 to October 7<sup>th</sup> 2019 to drive up awareness and utilisation of the card ([MoV-57](#)).

To build on media engagement, SUCCESS communications team began a series of media advocacy sessions this year, the first of which took place on September 17, 2019 in Hyderabad. Journalists from national and local Sindhi TV channels and newspapers attended the session that focused on introducing SUCCESS, discussing issues in local media and development reporting, and sourcing of data on poverty and development indicators. The 2-

hour session was followed by a field visit to UC Dasori in Tando Allahyar where journalists interacted with members of LSO Dasori to hear about their challenges, and the solutions they are now implementing to improve their social and economic well-being through SUCCESS (MoV-58). Local journalists reported on the event in the Sindhi language daily “Daily Sindhi Express” and local TV channel “Awaz TV” leading to further exposure for the programme (MoV-59, MoV-60). Further sessions are planned for next year in other programme districts.

#### **A4.12. Documentation of LSO initiatives**

RSPN in the reporting period has documented the work of 14 LSOs in its LSO Initiatives Series to showcase the work these organisations are doing on their own for their people. Two additional LSO initiatives have been uploaded and printed in October 2019, with the latest being Issue 48. Issue 40 and 41 were translated into Urdu as well for wider dissemination.

The LSO Initiatives contain case studies about the activities and achievements of the LSOs. The focus is on LSOs supporting member VOs/COs, advocating with the government for services and funds, creating social accountability for local governments, streamlining the management of local natural resources and strengthening local school and health systems. These LSO Initiatives are published and disseminated widely in print and digital format (MoV-61).

#### **A4.13. Publication of RSPN annual report highlighting the SUCCESS Programme**

Every year, RSPN publishes an annual report for its overall interventions. A considerable part of the report is devoted to highlighting the achievements of the SUCCESS programme. The Annual Report 2018 has been designed, published, and shared with all relevant stakeholders in March 2019 and is available both on the RSPN and SUCCESS websites (MoV-62).

#### **A4.14. Publication of Quarterly RSPs Social Mobilisation Outreach**

The Outreach is a quarterly publication presenting an update on the overall Social Mobilisation progress achieved by all RSPs during the dedicated quarter. RSPN has published five issues of Quarterly RSPs Social Mobilisation Outreach during the reporting period. Five issues of Outreach newsletter: Outreach 37 (April-June 2018), Outreach 38 (July-September 2018), Outreach 39 (October-December 2018), Outreach 40 (January-March 2019) and Outreach 41 (April to June 2019) are available on the SUCCESS website (MoV-63, MoV-64, MoV-65, MoV-66, MoV-67). Outreach 42 from July to September 2019 is in process of compilation and will be published in November 2019.

The Outreach newsletters feature key achievements, progress, success stories and other relevant information on promoting the CDD approach in Pakistan through the RSPs. The series include features on the SUCCESS programme and are published and widely distributed to various stakeholders including policy makers, donors, NGOs and other stakeholders in both electronic and print form.

#### **A4.15. Up-gradation and maintenances of SUCCESS website**

The SUCCESS website ([www.success.org.pk](http://www.success.org.pk)) was developed in the first year of the programme and is updated on a regular basis. At the start of each year, the website is reviewed thoroughly by the communication team of SUCCESS along with the technical team of the agency providing maintenance services, for upgradation and adding new features to the website. During the reporting period, the design was improved with categorisation in each component of the website to improve accessibility of information and visibility of the website. In fact, a full revamp of the website is underway to accommodate the fast flow of incoming information about the programme as well as to incorporate changes and outlook in line with

digital needs of a development project. This will establish its well-rounded presence on the web, with the website being one of the most prominent visibility products, complimented by an increased investment of resources in SUCCESS' digital media suite.

The website is being updated regularly to disseminate details about key programme events. It also contains news, reports, blogs, a photo gallery, a video gallery, a calendar of events, PDF copies of all publications, details about programme components, as well as graphical representation of the progress being made in terms of social mobilisation under the SUCCESS programme. The SUCCESS website received 16,017 visits per month, on average in the reporting period.

#### ***A4.16. Printing of visibility items (e.g. folders, posters, note pads, photographs, etc.)***

As per EU's Visibility Guideline, visibility items with the approval of EU have been used in various events and publications done so far (MoV-68).

To replenish the earlier stock of visibility items, RSPN initiated the production of four new types of visibility items last year (including diaries, key rings, tote bags and USB wristbands). The diaries was the only item that was still under production at the time of the last interim report. They were delivered during the current reporting period. RSPN increased EU and SUCCESS visibility by sharing these visibility items as visibility packages with stakeholders of the government, other partners and the media.

#### ***A4.17. Publications of research reports/ research papers/policy briefs and studies***

During the reporting period short case studies of SUCCESS beneficiaries were conducted from each of the programme districts and published as a booklet titled "The Echoes of SUCCESS". The Echoes of SUCCESS series presents a narrative take on the interventions and impact of SUCCESS through the lens of women empowerment. It is a compilation of 'human interest stories' categorised into themes of women economic, social and legal empowerment.

All eight booklets for each district were printed and made available online. These booklet series have been sent to relevant stakeholders (government officials, donor agencies, media personnel). Multiple copies have been sent to their respective RSP district office for their own advocacy purposes as well. The booklets are showcased at RSPN's events and advocacy sessions for wider dissemination.

#### ***A4.18 Media Campaign (Electronic) – New activity added in year 4***

Over the last three years, SUCCESS has made its footprints on print media featuring over two dozen' newspaper articles and numerous reports. However, its foot print on the electronic media remained a challenge due to resource constraints. A new activity was added in the fourth year work plan to address this need and a robust media campaign on TV was planned for June-September 2019. However, it was later moved to 2020, to link it with more communication products available and to make a more meaningful impact.

#### ***2.3. If relevant, submit a revised logframe, highlighting the changes.***

The logframe has not been changed.







## 2.5 Budget Utilisation and Projection for the next year

This section is added in response to the comments on the 2nd years Interim Report from the EU. Summary of the budget utilisation of the reporting period and projection for the next years is presented in Table 5.

Table 5: Budget utilisation of Year 4 and projection for Year 5

Activity Numbers	Activity Description	(Oct-2018 to Sep-2019)		Utilisation Rate (%)	Main Reasons for under utilisation	(Oct-2019 to Sep-2020) Budget (EUR)
		Budget (EUR)	Costs (EUR)			
1	Human Resources	364,670	291,425	79.9	Change in exchange rate	357,837
2	Travel	30,464	21,392	70.2	Change in exchange rate	27,290
3	Equipment and supplies	8,373	6,753	80.7	Change in exchange rate	6,714
4	Local office	38,112	22,556	59.2	Change in exchange rate and for some activities actual costs were lower than budgeted	29,099
5	Other costs, services	171,634	91,762	53.5	Change in exchange rate and two activities (Annual Evaluation and Electronic media campaign were dropped)	199,315
6	Other (Programme Costs)	259,054	132,254	51.1	Change in exchange rate and three (Exposure visit to India, meeting of RSPs resource groups, FACT and SSRG) activities were dropped	233,650
7	Subtotal direct eligible costs of the Action (1-6)	872,307	566,143	64.9		853,906
8	Indirect costs (7% of direct eligible costs of the Action)	61,062	39,630	64.9		59,773
9	Total eligible costs of the Action (7+ 8)	933,369	605,773	64.9		913,679
10	Provision for contingency reserve	-	-			
11	<b>Total eligible costs (9+10)</b>	<b>933,369</b>	<b>605,773</b>	<b>64.9</b>		<b>913,679</b>

## 3. Beneficiaries/affiliated entities and other Cooperation

### 3.1 How do you assess the relationship between the Beneficiaries/affiliated entities of this grant contract (i.e. those having signed the mandate for the Coordinator or an affiliated entity statement)? Please provide specific information for each Beneficiaries/affiliated entity.

The main beneficiaries of RSPN component of the SUCCESS Programme include the three implementing RSPs, National Rural Support Programme (NRSP), Sindh Rural Support Organisation (SRSO) and Thardeep Rural Development Programme (TRDP). Under this grant contract, the relationship of RSPN with the beneficiaries is largely that of supportive supervision and technical support in the implementation of SUCCESS programme activities. This includes on-going assistance in monitoring of the implementation processes, and as well as coordination support and communication of the SUCCESS.

The relationship is centred on facilitation for the implementation of the programme through standardised approach, and technical backstopping if and when an issue arises. RSPN also facilitates the beneficiaries in providing a platform to carry out planned joint activities such as

joint procurement of a third party consulting firm for the baseline surveys, MHI and TVST component of the programme. The relationship also builds upon providing a channel of communication for implementation of programme activities and lesson learning, which RSPN promotes between the three RSPs, the TA, PPRP and Government of Sindh. The relationship has remained beneficial for RSPN as well as for the partner RSPs in implementation of the SUCCESS programme as the fourth year concludes. Monthly joint review meetings with the partner RSPs and EU; and quarterly joint review meetings with RSPs, PPRP, and TA team hosted by RSPN have helped in improved coordination among all the stakeholders and helped in resolving some of the field issues.

On 2<sup>nd</sup> May a quarterly joint review of SUCCESS and PPRP with the EU and implementing partner RSPs, RSPN and SUCCESS TA team was arranged. The meeting included progress review of the EU-funded SUCCESS, GoS funded PPRP, update on the implementation of the EU TA supported government of Sindh Poverty Reduction Strategy, and an update on external evaluations of UCBPRP and SUCCESS.

Since the MTR and EPM recommendations and reports have made available to the RSPs, the RSPN team have formed an action plan and prepared proposals with consultation from the RSPs. The RSPN SUCCESS team, heads of RSPs and RSPN discussed the MTR recommendations at the Sixth Oversight Committee and a subsequent meeting in detail on 27 and 28 June. A more detailed action plan was prepared by the SUCCESS programme leads when the SUCCESS RSPN team travelled to NRSP's field office in Hyderabad. The action plan regarding the MTR recommendations was shared with EU for their feedback in July 2019. SUCCESS Programme Managers from the RSPs discussed the findings of the EPM recommendations with the RSPN SUCCESS team and top management to establish a coordinated response and understanding of the recommendations. Considering recommendations from both MTR and EPM, a more detailed proposal (including revising TVST and incorporating an adult literacy programme) will be developed with RSPs programme leads and presented to the EU.

### **3.2 How would you assess the relationship between your organisation and State authorities in the Action countries? How has this relationship affected the Action?**

The relationship between RSPN and state authorities has developed positively as a result of the Action. The provincial government have been cooperative and have continued to participate in various activities under the SUCCESS programme in year four.

The participation of senior government representatives has created ownership of the programme. The awareness about the RSPs work is opening different venues of synergies between RSPs and other donor agencies as well as private sector.

The relationship between the local district government authorities and the implementing RSPs has also been strengthened. The feedback from the district teams has been positive and the teams have claimed that the local government officials were very open and willing to coordinate and work together with them for the benefit of participating Community Institutions, i.e. LSOs/VOs/COs. This cooperation can be seen in the Deputy Commissioners notification of Community Institutions and registration of LSOs by the Social Welfare Department.

The district governments have also notified the Joint Development Committees (JDCs) at district and Taluka level in all eight districts of SUCCESS. The key objective of JDCs is to create synergies between the Community Institutions (CO/VO/LSO) and local administrations/departments and externally supported development investment in the programme districts in the planning of SUCCESS interventions. The strong linkage has led to the line departments signing MoUs with RSPs for effective implementation of public service delivery plans through the Community Institutions. Moreover, the Government is increasingly

recognised the efforts of the SUCCESS programme, such as the voter registration due to the efforts of the CIs.

This participatory planning approach will provide a learning platform for all actors concerned to avoid duplication of efforts and monitoring of collaborative efforts to influence development results. It will also contribute to the SUCCESS TA team work with the Government of Sindh to develop the Poverty Reduction Strategy (PRS), which was approved by the Sindh Cabinet on October 16, 2018.

Two separate training sessions for provincial and local government representatives was arranged in November 2018 and March 2019 to consider participatory planning and the CDLD approach. TRDP brought together seven members of the Joint Development Committee from government departments, three elected local body members, five representatives of non-governmental organisations and five LSO representatives in the first session. The participants were also taken on an exposure visit to Matiari, one of NRSP's SUCCESS programme districts for learning and sharing experiences. The second training was held in March 2019 in Hyderabad that comprised of 15 government officials and four LSO representatives, who were taken to visit village Thano Bula Khan in Jamshoro for cross-learning.

During the reporting period, Syeda Shehla Raza, Pakistan's People's Party elected Member of Provincial Assembly (MPA) in the Sindh Assembly, who currently serves as the Provincial Minister for Women Development, accompanied the Lesson Learnings and Experience Sharing Delegation on their visit to Tando Allahyar. The Provincial Minister appreciated the work carried out by RSPs and praised women community activists for working for the betterment of their communities. Makhdoom Ali Muhammad Walhari, District Chairman, Tando Allahyar and Asif Ali Khaskheli, Additional Deputy Commissioner-II, Tando Allahyar extended their full support to the delegation and arranged a lunch and discussion for the participants.

Syeda Shehla Raza (Sindh Minister for Women Development) was also asked to join the panel at the Policy and Advocacy Dialogue on Health, Local Governance and Women Empowerment on August 07, 2019, in Karachi, Pakistan. Other government officials in the panel discussion included Ms Nuzhat Shirin (Chairperson, Sindh Commission on the Status of Women), Dr Sonia Riaz (Deputy Director, Prime Minister's National Health Programme) and Dr Shereen Mustafa Narejo (Secretary, Planning and Development Department, Sindh) who championed policy recommendations from the SUCCESS studies and shared further insight into the programme. Inspired by the discussion, Minister Shehla Raza announced forming a group of all female MPAs of Sindh Assembly to pick districts in Sindh to oversee human development programmes being implemented and report on the progress.

In 2018 the Chief Minister and cabinet formally approved the Poverty Reduction Strategy and CDLD policy developed with the SUCCESS TA team. PPRP developed a similar MIS system which is used under the SUCCESS programme. The PPRP has also adopted the concept of Joint Development Committees.

In addition to this, the SUCCESS team has also provided PSC survey data and list of Community Institutions to the Government of Sindh's Accelerated Action Plan for Reduction of Stunting & Malnourishment (AAP) and the EU funded Programme for Improving Nutrition in Sindh (PINS) partners including ACF. This will help in integration of the nutrition programmes of GoS and EU with community development programme of SUCCESS for better impact.

The relationship with the government has influenced the programme positively, in a short amount of time. However, despite a good relationship with the government this approach needs to be institutionalised through a policy framework. This is where the TA-component of the SUCCESS programme plays a role. The TA component has been assisting the GoS in

preparing a Poverty Reduction Strategy and a Community Driven Local Development (CDLD) policy to institutionalise this approach at the provincial government level. The Poverty Reduction Strategy of the Government of Sindh which was developed with the assistance of the EU SUCCESS Technical Assistance team, was approved by the Sindh Cabinet, under the chairmanship of the Honourable Chief Minister of Sindh, Mr Murad Ali Shah on October 16, 2018. The Sindh Cabinet formally approved and adopted the Poverty Reduction Strategy, and agreed a proposed budget of PKR 72.5 billion for its implementation over an initial five-year period.

Furthermore, at the field level, linkages have been made by the RSPs with Directorate Malaria Control Programme, Election Commission of Pakistan, Pakistan Council for Research in Water Resources (PCRWR), Social Welfare Department, NADRA, Sindh Irrigated Agriculture Productivity Enhancement Project and Sindh Education Foundation.

### **3.3 Where applicable, describe your relationship with any other organisations involved in implementing the Action:**

The SUCCESS programme focuses on undertaking Community Driven Development (CDD) approach and stimulating CDD initiatives in eight poor rural districts of Sindh, to reduce poverty, paying particular attention to empowering women. Under the programme, 770,000 poor rural households are to be mobilised and organised into a network of community institutions.

The GoS, upon looking at the success of the CDD approach all over the nation, requested for assistance in developing the PRS and CDLD Policy framework to institutionalise the approach. For this purpose, RSPN has been continuously supporting the EU TA Team in coordinating with the Government and other stakeholders by organising workshops and meetings and providing input through the lens of the organisational experience gathered over years working on CDD approach, and documenting the knowledge products. The Poverty Reduction Strategy (PRS) has been approved by the Government of Sindh (GoS) and its official launch took place on March 28, 2018 with full support of the GoS. It is expected that with this policy in place, the government departments will be able to link their services with the Community Institutions and enable genuine demand of the people to meet supply and effectively promote the development of the rural poor.

Moreover, due to the notification of the district governments in Sindh, various line departments have signed MoUs with the implementing partners, and this would facilitate the processes and assist the members of Community Institutions to access the public services smoothly.

### **3.4 Where applicable, outline any links and synergies you have developed with other actions.**

The SUCCESS programme has been acting as a platform for RSPN as well as partners RSPs to explore avenues for synergies with other organisations and programmes. The EU funded programmes being implemented in different parts of Pakistan: PINS in Sindh, Balochistan Rural Development and Community Empowerment Programme (BRACE) in eight districts of Balochistan, Delivering Accelerated Family Planning in Pakistan (DAFPAK), and also the PPRP in Sindh by the GoS, are all closely linked to the SUCCESS programme. The team members of SUCCESS have been participating in the workshops and ceremonies organised by these programmes to showcase support and learn the workings of these programmes in their areas and explore possible avenues of collaboration.

A delegation from the European Union that included Ms Vibeke Jensen (Country Director UNESCO) and Ms Nicole Malpas (First Secretary, Education and Culture, Delegation of European Union to Pakistan) visited the historical archaeological site of Mohenjo Daro and

the associated museum in Larkana on December 6, 2018. Later, the delegation participated in an 'activists workshop' that was arranged by SRSO in village Imam Bux Mallah, where women leaders discussed their progress and achievements to empower women in an effort to reduce poverty.

The SUCCESS team also organised a visit of the EU delegation comprising of Ms Vivien Rigler and Mr Roberto Martin Aparicio in districts Tando Muhammad Khan and Jamshoro on 31 April, 2019 and 1 May, 2019. Meanwhile, Mr Jean-François Cautain, Ambassador of the European Union to Pakistan, his wife Sonia Cautain visited field areas in District Larkana on April 29, 2019. The aim for both visits was to witness the on-ground activities first-hand for effective execution of the programme. The Ambassador carried out meetings with Deputy Commissioners of Larkana and Kambar Shahdadkot, representatives from government line departments and other stakeholders to discuss the coordination mechanisms at the grassroots level with organised communities.

In December 2018, a joint meeting was carried out with SUCCESS and PINS key staff in Karachi to develop synergy between EU funded projects in Sindh. The aim of the meeting was to finalise agenda for scheduled synergy workshops at the district level; and to improve field level coordination and integration to enhance effectiveness of the EU supported programmes (MoV-69). As a result, in January 2019, a synergy workshop for SUCCESS and PINS was carried out in District Jamshoro. Some of the agreed action points included developing a joint Field Unit Level Plan for the staff of both PINS and SUCCESS. PINS and SUCCESS/UCBPRP staff will ensure that all VO and LSO level meetings are being held regularly on a monthly basis and are well documented in the provided registers. PINS and SUCCESS MIS will be interrelated and will be presented through live data to avoid duplication. SUCCESS and PINS staff will maintain their daily diary/NFR as a standard practice and as per the PIM procedure (MoV-70).

RSPN in partnership with RSPs is implementing PSI/DFID supported "Delivering Accelerated Family Planning in Pakistan-DAFPAK" Project in ten districts of Pakistan including two SUCCESS districts (Jamshoro and Kambar Shahdadkot) and two districts of UCBPRP (Jacobabad and Shikarpur). RSPN partnered with SRSO and TRDP to implement this project in the SUCCESS districts. Field level implementation of this project was initiated in June 2018. Delivering Accelerated Family Planning in Pakistan (DAFPAK) is a four-year project that aims to create an enabling environment for women, girls and men to avail healthy reproductive choices; increase the availability of family planning services and products in uncovered rural areas, and strengthen accountability through increased transparency and stringent monitoring.

The SUCCESS team also arranged meetings with senior officers from Growth for Rural Advancement and Sustainable Progress (GRASP) such as Mr. Olivier Marty and Robert Skidmore, to explore possibilities of synergies with the EU funded programme. GRASP is a six-year project designed to reduce poverty in Pakistan by strengthening small-scale agribusinesses in two provinces: Balochistan and Sindh. It will help small and medium-sized enterprises in horticulture and livestock become more competitive by making improvements at all levels of the value chain. These meetings and workshops taking place throughout July and August 2019 have proved fruitful as discussions of redesigning TVST is simultaneously taking place to include value chains and market demand.

In the academic sector, internship opportunities were provided to students of Cardiff University, University of Central Asia Kazakhstan, Pakistan Institute of Development Economics (PIDE), Quaid-e-Azam University, and National Defence University.

**3.5 If your organisation has received previous EU grants in view of strengthening the same target group, in how far has this Action been able to build upon/complement the previous one(s)? (List all previous relevant EU grants)**

RSPN has not received any previous EU grants in strengthening the same target group in SUCCESS districts. However, RSPN has received grants for the implementation of the ER 3 component of the Programme for Improved Nutrition in Sindh (PINS) project. The programme is now being implemented in ten districts of Sindh of which eight are SUCCESS programme districts. During the design of the PINS programme, various consultation meetings were held with key stakeholders to supplement and complement the work of SUCCESS.

**4. Visibility**

Visibility and communication is one of the key area of the RSPN component. The communication activities of the first half of year four are being implemented and the detail progress has already been presented under Results – 4 above.

The number of people following the page is 27,000 while the SUCCESS website has more than 16,017 visits per month, on average. The SUCCESS Twitter handle @SUCCESSinSindh has been functional since 2017 generating significant engagement for relevant content. 115,751 tweet impressions were generated for the period October 2018 to September 2019. In April 2018, an Instagram account for SUCCESS was setup at Instagram.com/successinsindh focusing solely on visual content and beneficiary stories, and presenting a strong picture for Sindh and women empowerment in Sindh. Today, the account has increased organic following to 692 from 548 since last reporting period.

In addition to this, RSPN lays great emphasis on acknowledging the generous support of the European Union in line with the contract. Visibility of the European Union is ensured through various measures, including displaying of the logo on all published material, and banners used in the field and during various events. All press releases include clear and prominent details about the European Union funding the programme. All posts on Facebook and Twitter mention European Union as the funding agency. The SUCCESS website complies with the visibility guidelines of the European Union. All publications and visibility material are finalised after the approval of the European Union.

**The European Commission may wish to publicise the results of Actions. Do you have any objection to this report being published on the EuropeAid website? If so, please state your objections here.**

No Objection

Name of the contact person for the Action:

**Khaleel Ahmed Tetlay, Chief Operating Officer**

Signature: .....

Location: 3rd Floor, IRM Complex, Plot # 7, Sunrise Avenue (off Park Road) Near COMSATS University, Islamabad, Pakistan

Date report due: By Nov 30, 2019

Date report sent: Nov 15, 2019

## Annex – 1: List of Means of Verification

Ref	Title
MoV-1	First Interim Report <a href="https://success.org.pk/wp-content/uploads/2017/10/First-Interim-Narrative-Report-October-2015-September-2016.pdf">https://success.org.pk/wp-content/uploads/2017/10/First-Interim-Narrative-Report-October-2015-September-2016.pdf</a>
MoV-2	SUCCESS External Evaluation Report by Izhar Hunzai <a href="https://success.org.pk/wp-content/uploads/2018/07/SUCCESS-RSPN-Annual-Evaluation-Year-2.pdf">https://success.org.pk/wp-content/uploads/2018/07/SUCCESS-RSPN-Annual-Evaluation-Year-2.pdf</a>
MoV-3	Mid-term Review of Sindh Union Council and Community Economic Strengthening Support (SUCCESS) in Eight Districts of Sindh Province in Pakistan <a href="https://drive.google.com/open?id=16SI5DxhhZ8QP-tON0Y-pgFjSiNwH6RzR">https://drive.google.com/open?id=16SI5DxhhZ8QP-tON0Y-pgFjSiNwH6RzR</a>
MoV-4	External Performance Monitoring of SUCCESS Programme – First Interim Report <a href="https://drive.google.com/file/d/1CXWEY6B8XYoD4PI19z8UchotOu1rNTQL/view">https://drive.google.com/file/d/1CXWEY6B8XYoD4PI19z8UchotOu1rNTQL/view</a>
MoV-5	Rural Support Programmes' Self-Evaluation for the SUCCESS Mid-term Review <a href="https://success.org.pk/wp-content/uploads/2019/05/SUCCESS-Self-evaluation-Final-Report.pdf">https://success.org.pk/wp-content/uploads/2019/05/SUCCESS-Self-evaluation-Final-Report.pdf</a>
MoV-6	1 <sup>st</sup> Institutional Maturity Index (IMI) Report <a href="https://success.org.pk/wp-content/uploads/2019/03/IMI%20Analysis%20Report%20Institutional%20Assessment%20of%20Community%20Institutions%202018.pdf">https://success.org.pk/wp-content/uploads/2019/03/IMI%20Analysis%20Report%20Institutional%20Assessment%20of%20Community%20Institutions%202018.pdf</a>
MoV-7	Notes for Record ( <i>available on request</i> )
MoV-8	Draft Key Performance Indicators (KPI) Report ( <i>available on request</i> )
MoV-9	Second Interim Report <a href="https://success.org.pk/wp-content/uploads/2017/12/Second-Interim-Narrative-Report-Oct-2016-Sept-2017.pdf">https://success.org.pk/wp-content/uploads/2017/12/Second-Interim-Narrative-Report-Oct-2016-Sept-2017.pdf</a>
MoV-10	Third Interim Report <a href="https://success.org.pk/wp-content/uploads/2019/04/Third%20Narrative%20Interim%20Report%20(October%202017-%20September%202018).pdf">https://success.org.pk/wp-content/uploads/2019/04/Third%20Narrative%20Interim%20Report%20(October%202017-%20September%202018).pdf</a>
MoV-11	24th SMRT Meeting Minutes ( <i>available on request</i> )
MoV-12	25th SMRT Meeting Minutes ( <i>available on request</i> )
MoV-13	Project Design Training Workshop & Joint RSPN Resource Groups Meeting Minutes ( <i>available on request</i> )
MoV-14	FACE Meeting Minutes ( <i>available on request</i> )
MoV-15	GRG Meeting Minutes ( <i>available on request</i> )
MoV-16	LSO Convention 2019 Report <a href="https://success.org.pk/wp-content/uploads/2019/09/National-Convention-of-LSOs-2019-Report-Final.pdf">https://success.org.pk/wp-content/uploads/2019/09/National-Convention-of-LSOs-2019-Report-Final.pdf</a>
MoV-17	Fincon's Socio-Economic First Follow up Survey 2018 ( <i>available on request</i> )
MoV-18a	Micro Health Insurance Study: "Availability does not mean utilisation: Challenges and enablers to the utilisation of Micro-Health Insurance in SUCCESS programme" ( <i>available on request</i> )
MoV-18b	Policy Brief on the Micro Health Insurance Study ( <i>available on request</i> )
MoV-19a	Joint Development Committees Study: "Challenges to citizen-driven local governance: Lessons from Pakistan" ( <i>available on request</i> )
MoV-19b	Policy Brief on the Joint Development Committees Study ( <i>available on request</i> )
MoV-20a	Study on Pathways to Social and Economic Empowerment of Rural Women through SUCCESS Programme <a href="https://success.org.pk/wp-content/uploads/2019/06/Women-Empowerment-Final.pdf">https://success.org.pk/wp-content/uploads/2019/06/Women-Empowerment-Final.pdf</a>

Ref	Title
MoV-20b	Policy Brief on Women Empowerment Study ( <i>available on request</i> )
MoV-21	Lessons Learning and Experience Sharing Visit Report 2019 <a href="https://success.org.pk/wp-content/uploads/2019/04/Lesson-learning-and-experience-sharing-report-%E2%80%93-2019.pdf">https://success.org.pk/wp-content/uploads/2019/04/Lesson-learning-and-experience-sharing-report-%E2%80%93-2019.pdf</a>
MoV-22	Lesson Learning and Experience Sharing Visit Media Coverage <a href="https://success.org.pk/index.php/in-news/page/2/">https://success.org.pk/index.php/in-news/page/2/</a>
MoV-23	Young Development Programme ToRs <a href="https://success.org.pk/wp-content/uploads/2018/11/ToRs-YDPs-SUCCESS-2018-19.pdf">https://success.org.pk/wp-content/uploads/2018/11/ToRs-YDPs-SUCCESS-2018-19.pdf</a>
MoV-24	Echoes of SUCCESS <a href="https://success.org.pk/index.php/echoes-of-success/">https://success.org.pk/index.php/echoes-of-success/</a>
MoV-25	Talk on “Bottom-link governance for sustainable development: Insights from a large-scale poverty reduction programme in Pakistan” ( <i>available on request</i> )
MoV-26	Research Paper “Reproductive health services: “Business-in-a-Box” as a model social innovation” <a href="https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/pdf/10.1080/09614524.2018.1541166?needAccess=true&amp;">https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/pdf/10.1080/09614524.2018.1541166?needAccess=true&amp;</a>
MoV-27	Talk at Lahore University of Management Sciences (LUMS) University on a study titled “Drivers of Empowerment for Rural Women: Insights from Rural Support Programmes in Sindh” ( <i>available on request</i> )
MoV-28	Draft Paper on “The Relationship between Access to Land and Rural Poverty in Sindh Province of Pakistan: A Pathway out of Poverty” ( <i>available on request</i> )
MoV-29	Media Mention in Article titled “Success of CPEC linked to job opportunities for Pakistanis” in the leading English daily ‘The Dawn’ <a href="https://www.dawn.com/news/1479263">https://www.dawn.com/news/1479263</a>
MoV-30	Article titled “Tenants have no way out” in the leading English daily ‘The Dawn’ <a href="https://www.dawn.com/news/1458824/tenants-have-no-way-out">https://www.dawn.com/news/1458824/tenants-have-no-way-out</a>
MoV-31	Article titled “The rural face of poverty” in the leading English daily ‘The Dawn’ <a href="https://www.dawn.com/news/1448968/the-rural-face-of-poverty">https://www.dawn.com/news/1448968/the-rural-face-of-poverty</a>
MoV-32	Global Communications and Visibility Plan SUCCESS <a href="https://success.org.pk/wp-content/uploads/2018/09/SUCCESS%20Global%20Communication%20&amp;%20Visibility%20Plan.pdf">https://success.org.pk/wp-content/uploads/2018/09/SUCCESS%20Global%20Communication%20&amp;%20Visibility%20Plan.pdf</a>
MoV-33	Policy and Advocacy Dialogue on Health, Local Governance and Women Empowerment – 2019 Report <a href="https://success.org.pk/wp-content/uploads/2019/09/Policy-and-advocacy-dialogue-report-Final.pdf">https://success.org.pk/wp-content/uploads/2019/09/Policy-and-advocacy-dialogue-report-Final.pdf</a>
MoV-34	SUCCESS Lahooti Melo Report <a href="https://success.org.pk/wp-content/uploads/2019/04/Lahooti-Melo-2019-Final-.pdf">https://success.org.pk/wp-content/uploads/2019/04/Lahooti-Melo-2019-Final-.pdf</a>
MoV-35	19 <sup>th</sup> Annual Population Research Conference Event Report <a href="https://drive.google.com/file/d/1dbkat4meoEtpQO2iVNIfV-Jx_5hCiXOJ/view">https://drive.google.com/file/d/1dbkat4meoEtpQO2iVNIfV-Jx_5hCiXOJ/view</a>
MoV-36	11 <sup>th</sup> Annual Conference on International Day of Rural Women Event Report <a href="https://drive.google.com/file/d/1DRGS_BubG86NDpWxHlij521n60E3Wgqp/view">https://drive.google.com/file/d/1DRGS_BubG86NDpWxHlij521n60E3Wgqp/view</a>
MoV-37	Tajikistan: Experience Sharing and Learning Visit Report <a href="https://success.org.pk/wp-content/uploads/2019/03/Tajikistan%20Experience%20Sharing%20and%20Learning%20Visit%20Report%202018.pdf">https://success.org.pk/wp-content/uploads/2019/03/Tajikistan%20Experience%20Sharing%20and%20Learning%20Visit%20Report%202018.pdf</a>
MoV-38	Blog titled “Tajik Women in Income Generation Activities” <a href="https://success.org.pk/index.php/tajik-women-in-income-generation-activities/">https://success.org.pk/index.php/tajik-women-in-income-generation-activities/</a>
MoV-39	Article titled “Taking Inspiration from Tajikistan” in the leading English newspaper ‘Daily Times’



Ref	Title
	<a href="https://dailytimes.com.pk/422627/educating-pakistan-taking-inspiration-from-tajikistan/">https://dailytimes.com.pk/422627/educating-pakistan-taking-inspiration-from-tajikistan/</a>
MoV-40	Exposure and Learning Visit to AKRSP Gilgit-Baltistan Report <a href="https://success.org.pk/wp-content/uploads/2019/05/Exposure-and-Learning-Visit-to-AKRSP-Gilgit-Baltistan.pdf">https://success.org.pk/wp-content/uploads/2019/05/Exposure-and-Learning-Visit-to-AKRSP-Gilgit-Baltistan.pdf</a>
MoV-41	RSPs' Annual Strategy Retreat 2019 Report <a href="https://success.org.pk/wp-content/uploads/2019/10/RSPs-Annual-Strategy-Retreat-2019-Final.pdf">https://success.org.pk/wp-content/uploads/2019/10/RSPs-Annual-Strategy-Retreat-2019-Final.pdf</a>
MoV-42	Human Diaries <a href="https://success.org.pk/index.php/video-gallery-category/human-diaries/">https://success.org.pk/index.php/video-gallery-category/human-diaries/</a>
MoV-43	Brief for SUCCESS's video diaries and documentary 2019 (available on request)
MoV-44	Blog article titled "Being your own hero" <a href="https://dailytimes.com.pk/349618/being-your-own-hero/">https://dailytimes.com.pk/349618/being-your-own-hero/</a>
MoV-45	Blog article in Sindh Express <a href="http://sindhexpress.com.pk/epaper/index.aspx?Issue=NP_HYD&amp;Page=Magazine012&amp;Date=20190211&amp;Pageno=10&amp;View=1">http://sindhexpress.com.pk/epaper/index.aspx?Issue=NP_HYD&amp;Page=Magazine012&amp;Date=20190211&amp;Pageno=10&amp;View=1</a>
MoV-46	Blog article in Sindh Express <a href="http://sindhexpress.com.pk/epaper/index.aspx?Issue=NP_HYD&amp;Page=Magazine012&amp;Date=20190214&amp;Pageno=10&amp;View=1">http://sindhexpress.com.pk/epaper/index.aspx?Issue=NP_HYD&amp;Page=Magazine012&amp;Date=20190214&amp;Pageno=10&amp;View=1</a>
MoV-47	Blog article in Nawa-i-waqt <a href="https://www.nawaiwaqt.com.pk/E-Paper/islamabad/2019-02-23/page-11/detail-5">https://www.nawaiwaqt.com.pk/E-Paper/islamabad/2019-02-23/page-11/detail-5</a>
MoV-48	Blog article in Roznama Din <a href="https://drive.google.com/file/d/1frXkZ_CSIAXL1_SFuKsA3p2EZY8KeNHH/view">https://drive.google.com/file/d/1frXkZ_CSIAXL1_SFuKsA3p2EZY8KeNHH/view</a>
MoV-49	Blog article titled "Architect of her own destiny" <a href="https://dailytimes.com.pk/362563/architect-of-her-own-destiny/">https://dailytimes.com.pk/362563/architect-of-her-own-destiny/</a>
MoV-50	Blog article titled "A sisterhood of superheroes" <a href="https://dailytimes.com.pk/371190/a-sisterhood-of-superheroes/">https://dailytimes.com.pk/371190/a-sisterhood-of-superheroes/</a>
MoV-51	Blog article titled "A woman's worth" <a href="https://drive.google.com/file/d/17yqQE_N6ANYb7ybVZmGdqTe3P0JCSI0S/view">https://drive.google.com/file/d/17yqQE_N6ANYb7ybVZmGdqTe3P0JCSI0S/view</a>
MoV-52	Photo Story 3: A clean and green revolution <a href="https://success.org.pk/wp-content/uploads/2019/04/SUCCESS-Photo-Story-II-A-Clean-Revolution4.pdf">https://success.org.pk/wp-content/uploads/2019/04/SUCCESS-Photo-Story-II-A-Clean-Revolution4.pdf</a>
MoV-53	Photo Story 4: Roads much travelled <a href="https://success.org.pk/wp-content/uploads/2019/04/SUCCESS-Roads-Much-Travelled-Photo-Story-I-Final-Edits2.pdf">https://success.org.pk/wp-content/uploads/2019/04/SUCCESS-Roads-Much-Travelled-Photo-Story-I-Final-Edits2.pdf</a>
MoV-54a	SUCCESS Jingle Music Video <a href="https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=hv3EzIWW1qI">https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=hv3EzIWW1qI</a>
MoV-54b	SUCCESS Documentary (available on request)
MoV-55	SUCCESS Bi-Annual Newsletter Issue 6 <a href="https://success.org.pk/wp-content/uploads/2019/02/SUCCESS-Newsletter-6.pdf">https://success.org.pk/wp-content/uploads/2019/02/SUCCESS-Newsletter-6.pdf</a>
MoV-56a	SUCCESS Bi-Annual Newsletter Issue 7 (Long Version) <a href="https://success.org.pk/wp-content/uploads/2019/09/Newsletter-Designing.pdf">https://success.org.pk/wp-content/uploads/2019/09/Newsletter-Designing.pdf</a>
MoV-56b	SUCCESS Bi-Annual Newsletter Issue 7 (Short Version) <a href="https://success.org.pk/wp-content/uploads/2019/09/Newsletter-Printing.pdf">https://success.org.pk/wp-content/uploads/2019/09/Newsletter-Printing.pdf</a>
MoV-57	Instructional Video on Micro Health Insurance <a href="https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=RenRamzkZDo">https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=RenRamzkZDo</a>
MoV-58	Media Session Minutes (available on request)
MoV-59	Media Mention in Sindhi daily "Daily Sindh Express" <a href="https://sindhexpress.com.pk/epaper/PoPupwindow.aspx?newsID=130748337&amp;Issue=NP_HYD&amp;Date=20190919">https://sindhexpress.com.pk/epaper/PoPupwindow.aspx?newsID=130748337&amp;Issue=NP_HYD&amp;Date=20190919</a>
MoV-60	Media Mention on Sindhi News Channel "Awaz TV"

Ref	Title
	<a href="https://drive.google.com/file/d/1lhvI9DS38dCC3FzHXb6abas1tMXsZQcw/view">https://drive.google.com/file/d/1lhvI9DS38dCC3FzHXb6abas1tMXsZQcw/view</a>
MoV-61	LSO Initiatives <a href="https://success.org.pk/index.php/lso-initiatives">https://success.org.pk/index.php/lso-initiatives</a>
MoV-62	Annual Report 2018 <a href="https://success.org.pk/wp-content/uploads/2019/04/Annual%20Report%202018%20.pdf">https://success.org.pk/wp-content/uploads/2019/04/Annual%20Report%202018%20.pdf</a>
MoV-63	Outreach 37 <a href="https://success.org.pk/wp-content/uploads/2018/11/Outreach_37.pdf">https://success.org.pk/wp-content/uploads/2018/11/Outreach_37.pdf</a>
MoV-64	Outreach 38 <a href="https://success.org.pk/wp-content/uploads/2019/03/Outreach_38.pdf">https://success.org.pk/wp-content/uploads/2019/03/Outreach_38.pdf</a>
MoV-65	Outreach 39 <a href="https://success.org.pk/wp-content/uploads/2019/07/Outreach-39.pdf">https://success.org.pk/wp-content/uploads/2019/07/Outreach-39.pdf</a>
MoV-66	Outreach 40 <a href="https://success.org.pk/wp-content/uploads/2019/07/Outreach_40.pdf">https://success.org.pk/wp-content/uploads/2019/07/Outreach_40.pdf</a>
MoV-67	Outreach 41 <a href="https://success.org.pk/wp-content/uploads/2019/10/Outreach_41.pdf">https://success.org.pk/wp-content/uploads/2019/10/Outreach_41.pdf</a>
MoV-68	Visibility Items ( <i>available on request</i> )
MoV-69	Minutes of Joint SUCCESS & PINS Key Staff Meeting on Synergy Between SUCCESS, PPRP & PINS Programme ( <i>available on request</i> )
MoV-70	Minutes on Synergy Workshops for Project Staff of SUCCESS, PINS Nutrition Sensitive Component and Other Programmes/Projects in District Jamshoro ( <i>available on request</i> )

## Annex – 2: Draft Sustainability Strategy of SUCCESS

### Sindh Union Council and Community Economic Strengthening Support (SUCCESS) Programme (Draft SUSTAINABILITY STRATEGY)

#### 1. Introduction

This document outlines the sustainability strategy of the EU funded SUCCESS programme. The strategy is based on the factors and elements put in place in the design and implementation processes of the programme which will lead to the sustainability of the key aspects of the programme. However, the final strategy will evolve with the changing needs of the communities we work with and overall political, social and economic environment we work in. This document thus be treated as living document and will be updated overtime. Section 2, gives an overview of the SUCCESS programme approach in the perspective of sustainability. Section 3, defines sustainability and types of sustainability (institutional, financial, policy level and environmental) in the context of the SUCCESS programme. Section 4, presents the detailed sustainability strategy of SUCCESS. Within the section 4, the action points for sustainability in the remaining period of SUCCEES and beyond are highlighted in **bold**, *italic* text.

#### 2. An overview of the SUCCESS programme approach

SUCCESS is a six year long (2015-2021) programme that aspires to work exclusively with over 700,000 rural women to empower them and reduce household level poverty in Sindh. It is globally accepted that without empowered women, we can neither reduce poverty nor improve the social sector indicators on sustainable basis. SUCCESS is based on the Rural Support Programmes' (RSPs) social mobilisation approach to foster a Social Pillar to supplement and complement the two existing pillars of the state i.e. the administrative pillar (President to Patwari) and the political pillar (i.e. elected representatives from Prime Minister to the Union Councillors).

It is universally recognised that the administrative and political pillars of the State are neither adequate nor mandated to reach each and every poor rural household. As poverty exists at the household level, without support and interventions targeted at household level, the rural poor cannot rise above the level of subsistence. The experience of the distillation of successful poverty reduction initiatives worldwide demonstrate that without fostering a 'social pillar' to supplement and complement the two existing pillars of the State, the rural poor can neither be empowered nor enabled to improve their socio-economic status. Hence the need to mobilise and organise the poor into their own institutions, as potential partners to government.

The Social Mobilisation strategy of the RSPs is based on a development partnership between the rural poor and the Rural Support Programmes (RSPs), both partners have to fulfil their obligations. The Rural poor have to first get organised, identify an honest and sincere leader, adopt the discipline of savings to generate their own capital and meet on a regular basis to identify the potential of each poor household, through a households-level micro-investment plan. The RSPs' objectives is to help communities to form the social pillar, beginning with the building block of Community Organisations of 15-25 poor households, subsequently federating into a Village-level Organisation and finally the creation of an apex body of Village Organisations at the Union Council level called a Local Support Organisation. Depending on their maturity, LSOs form higher level Tehsil or District LSO networks for collaboration and cooperation with government departments, donors, NGOs and other stakeholders.

To effectively discharge their obligations, under the SUCCESS programme the Rural Support Programmes are endowed with resources to invest in the following development interventions, through the framework of people's organisations:

- **A cadre of community leaders:** A trained cadre of community leaders i.e. Presidents and Managers of community institutions (COs/VOs/LSOs);
- A trained cadre of Community Resource Persons (CRPs) with sector-specific knowledge to impart know-how to communities;
- **Community Investment Fund (CIF):** CIF is capital grant from SUCCESS to the community institutions, especially LSOs. The main purpose of the CIF is to support the financial and institutional sustainability of the community institutions, and to provide financial access to members. The LSOs manage the CIF as a revolving fund while offering micro loans to women. CIF targets the poor households identified through the Poverty Score Card (PSC) to ensure that only the households with a poverty score of 0-23 access capital, and start income generating activities.
- **Income Generating Grants (IGGs):** The main purpose of Income Generating Grants (IGGs) is to provide assistance to the poorest community members through a one-time cash grant so that they are able to start economic/income generating activities. The poverty scorecard is used to identify the eligible households to ensure that only the poorest households with a poverty score of (0-11) access the IGG. IGG grants largely enable the poorest to purchase assets such as livestock.
- **Technical and Vocational Skills Training (TVST):** The purpose of the TVST is to design and implement demand driven training programmes that enable people to generate incomes through skills imparted i.e. either by providing access to local labour markets or through (self)- employment.
- **Micro Health Insurance (MHI):** MHI is a social protection measure for the most destitute and vulnerable households. The objective of the MHI is to protect these families from health shocks that may push them deeper into poverty due to large expenses commonly incurred on health.
- **Community Physical Infrastructure (CPIs):** The purpose of the CPI projects is to improve basic community level infrastructure and productive assets. These projects are identified, implemented and maintained by the Village Organisations, thus building their institutional capacity and ownership and meeting their needs.

This is the holistic package of development to support the rural poor women to rise above the level of subsistence and empower them by fostering their own institutions. In addition, the rural poor need sectoral interventions such as education, health, sanitation, agriculture, livestock and other sectors. These sectors need immense resources with which relevant departments of the government are usually endowed. The institutions of the poor can be used as a conduit by government departments by entering into a partnership with the communities. Hence, mechanisms of planning and coordination such as the Joint Development Committees are being formed under SUCCESS at the local level and complementary policy changes being recommended through the Poverty Reduction Strategy (PRS) and Community Driven Local Development (CDLD) policy, at the provincial level, in order to sustain such links.

Under the SUCCESS programme the EU has supported the Government of Sindh, through the Technical Assistance component, to develop this Poverty Reduction Strategy (PRS) and a Community Driven Local Development (CDLD) policy. The Government of Sindh has approved the Poverty Reduction Strategy and will adopt it as a strategic framework for future interventions in poverty reduction. Under the Poverty Reduction Strategy, the Government now intends to expand the CDLD-based programme to all rural districts and to address urban poverty, starting with the rural areas of Karachi.

### 3. Definition and Types of Sustainability

**Definition:** According to the OECD DAC and EU evaluation methods, Vol.1, sustainability is defined as “The continuation of benefits from a development intervention after major development assistance has been completed. The probability of continued long-term benefits. The resilience to risk of the net benefit flows over time”.

**Types of Sustainability:** The key types of sustainability include:

- A. Institutional sustainability: e.g. structures that would allow the results of the action to continue to be in place after the end of the action, capacity building, agreements and local ‘ownership’ of action outcomes.
- B. Policy level sustainability: e.g., where applicable, structural impact (improved legislation, consistency with existing frameworks, codes of conduct, or methods).
- C. Environmental sustainability: what impact will the action have on the environment — have conditions been put in place to avoid negative effects on the natural resources on which the action depends and on the broader natural environment?
- D. Financial sustainability: e.g. financing of follow-up activities, sources of revenue for covering all future operating and maintenance costs.

### 4. Sustainability Strategy of SUCCESS

The design of the SUCCESS programme incorporates high level of sustainability aspects of results in terms of financial, institutional, policy level and environmental sustainability. As given in section 2, the RSPs promote a concept derived from over three decades of community-driven development experience across Pakistan. EU funding strengthens and broadens the RSP efforts to provide strategic support for scaling up of community-driven local development in Sindh through SUCCESS and the Government of Sindh funded Union Council Based Poverty Reduction Programme (UCBPRP) and the Extension of UCBPRP (now renamed as Peoples Poverty Reduction Programme). The following section describes the sustainability of the programme by type of sustainability.

- A. **Institutional sustainability:** The main thrust of the SUCCESS programme is fostering the social pillar i.e. fostering viable community institutions (LSOs, VOs and COs). The sustainability of these institutions lies in the following key elements:

**First, community institutions instil the principles of participation, inclusiveness, transparency, self-help, mutual and downward accountability to their members.** During the first three years of SUCCESS the RSPs remained focused on forming the community institutions with these principles in mind. As of January 2019, 548,662 rural women representing their households from a total target of 849,810 households are mobilised into 28,274 Community Organisations, 3,296 Village Organisations and 309 Local Support Organisations. The 548,662 women include 389,832 women from the poor households with a PSC score of 0-23 (84% of the total poor households).

An internal assessment of COs, VOs and LSOs according to the Institutional Maturity Index (IMI) in 2018, suggests high levels of discipline, inclusiveness and transparency of these institutions. For example:

- In all the 239 sample community institutions the community leaders were selected with the consensus of the community members, without external influence.
- All the Community Organisations have started a savings programme to generate their own capital
- Over 60% of community leaders (ie either presidents or managers) are from the poor households.

- Most community institutions have done more than 70% of their planned meetings and the attendance in these meetings has been above 70%.
- Through self-help initiatives, through implementing 21 out of 24 Resolutions passed by LSOs, the latter have been successful in addressing a number of issues of public interest such as tree plantation, issuance of CNICs, enrolment of out of school children in schools and women and children's immunisation.

However, most community institutions still face challenges with regards to 'downward accountability.' The IMI survey shows that one fifth of the LSOs do not share their progress with the VOs. However, about 47% (half) of the LSOs do share their progress, although informally.

**For the sustainability perspective in the remaining period of the SUCCESS implementation, the RSP social mobilisation teams need to invest in a quality dialogues with communities, to inspire these rural women to create more mutual and downward accountabilities, to further strengthen their community institutions.**

**Second**, the community institutions identify **honest and sincere leaders** that provide local leadership to the community institutions on a sustainable basis. These are volunteers with commitment to work for their people. As of January 2019, over 55,000 such women leaders were identified by the community institutions, and the RSPs invested in them through community management and leadership skills training. Capacitating these leaders to manage CIs and enabling them to link up to government services is critical for future sustainability.

**Third**, over 3,000 women were identified and trained as **Community Resource Persons (CRPs)**. The key function of these CRPs is to support the RSP social mobilisation teams in organising the left out households, into the community institutions, in supporting the community institutions in record keeping where the community leaders are not literate, and conducting awareness sessions on critical, cross cutting issues in the monthly meetings of the Community Organisations. Topics covered are health (family planning immunisation programmes, nutrition), the importance of education and increasing enrolment, water, sanitation, basic civic and women's rights (eg CNIC, birth, *nikah* rights and registration and voter registration). These CRPs are permanently based in the villages and part of the COs. They attend meetings of COs and provide information to them. It promotes positive behaviours in the community and likely to increase their access to services in future as well.

Adult literacy rates are abysmally low among the programme's target population. Overall 90% of the women and 95% of the women in the poor households (PSC 0-23) are not literate. Thus finding literate and willing CRPs is a key challenge in some areas. According to the IMI survey, among the community institution leaders 87% of the COs' leaders, 75% of the VOs' leaders and 42% of the LSOs' leaders are not literate. **In the remaining period of SUCCESS an Accelerated Adult Learning Programme for the existing community leaders and young adult members of the community institution will be useful to prepare the next phase of community leaders and contribute in sustainability of the community institutions.**

**Fourth**, the capacity of community institutions in identifying, prioritising, planning and implementing community development activities during and beyond the SUCCESS programme life. This includes development and implementation of Micro Investment Plans (MIPs) at the household level by the COs, Village Development Plans (VDPs) at the village level by VOs and Union Council Development Plans (UCDPs) at LSO level. As of Jan 2019, with the support of the RSPs the organised communities have developed MIPs for 76% of the COs, VDPs for 87% of VOs and UCDPs for 81% of LSOs formed so far. In addition to this 95% of the LSOs and 92% of the VOs have been notified by the local authorities and 92% of LSOs and 50% of VOs have opened their institutional bank accounts which allows these institutions to receive grants to implement their development plans. This local development

planning process needs updated and implemented over time. **During the remaining period of SUCCESS the RSPs need to consolidate and digitalise these development plans and beyond the SUCCESS life the RSPs needs to support the LSOs to regularly update, share and follow up with the government and other development organisations.**

**Fifth**, the key ingredient of Community Institutions' financial sustainability is the Community Investment Fund (CIF). CIF is a capital grant from SUCCESS to the community institutions, especially LSOs/VOs. The selected LSOs/VOs use this capital grant to extend small loans to the poor (PSC 0-23). Loans are extended through women members of the COs and the management of the CIF is also entrusted to the women members. The Rural Support Programme (RSP) provides technical support and training to help community institutions manage the CIF as a long term revolving fund. The CIF serves two broad objectives (a) it helps ensure the sustainability of COs/VOs/LSOs and (b) it helps poor members increase their incomes by setting up and enhancing the existing small businesses and creating livelihood assets (e.g. investment in livestock and agriculture inputs) through CIF loans.

To achieve the objective of sustainability of COs/VOs/LSOs through CIF, the RSP requires the LSO/VO who manage the CIF to take various steps before disbursing loans from their pool of CIF, these steps include: formation of a Credit Committee within the LSO/VO development of a Credit Policy explaining all terms and conditions by the LSO/VO, appointment of a book keeper by the LSO/VO, preparation of Micro Investment Plans by COs/Member households, training of office bearers in fund management, opening of a bank account and issuance of special instructions to the bank for safeguarding the CIF and method for processing loans from CO to VO to LSO etc. This CIF management process strengthens the institutional capacity of the LSO/VO which helps them continue their operations beyond the project life. In this process a large number of CO members learns financial management and become specialists in various sub components of CIF management. The LSO/VO managing the CIF generally start recovering a Service Charge from the CIF borrowers after completion of the project. This service charge helps recover the LSO/VO operating cost and loan losses if any and provides a continuous source for capacity building of community managers.

The objective of income generating activities through CIF is achieved by engaging all poor households in the preparation and implementation of household level MIPs. Without the intervention of CIF it is not possible for the CIs to engage all or majority of the target households in the development process. Hence it is the CIF which works as an entry point to engage the poor households who later get involved in a number of household and community level activities and develop the feeling of being the beneficiaries as well as the owners of the COs/VOs/LSOs.

As of January 2019, 282 LSOs have established their CIF worth Rs. 1.12 billion and provided loans to 37,604 women to start income generating activities. The LSOs have hired community bookkeepers to keep the loan records and RSPs provided the LSOs leaders and community bookkeepers' training on how to manage the CIF. The LSOs have developed policies and procedures (amount of loans, repayment terms, processing fee, service charge if any, methods for processing of loans and repayments etc.) of managing the CIF with the technical support of RSPs. The main principles around which the policies and procedures developed are: CIF is to be 'used and not consumed'; and serve maximum number of poor households.

In the first cycle of the CIF loans most of the LSOs opted for interest free loans with a minimal processing fee or services charges from their members given their limited financial capacity. **However, overtime the RSPs need to sensitise the LSOs about the diminishing real value of CIF (as result of inflation) and cover institutional costs of the LSO while taking interest on the CIF loans.**

**Another key challenge is large number of poor households and limited volume of the CIF amount available with LSOs. The current amount of CIF and IGG will only benefit maximum of 40% of the poor households (with PSC 0-23) during the programme period. Additional resources need to be invested in CIF to reach all the poor households.**

Evaluations led by RSPN have shown that CIF has resulted in the creation of financially sustainable access to finance for the poor and women. It has also strengthened social mobilisation on sustainable basis by directly encouraging the creation of community-based institutions, kept them active, functional and has also enhanced participation of the poor in such community institutions. It has also resulted in improving the livelihoods of individual borrowers and their households.

**Sixth**, is formally linking of community institutions with government line departments for sectoral services. Provision of basic services and supplies (education, health, sanitation, agriculture and livestock extension etc.) is the basic responsibility and mandate of the government. The institutions of the poor CO/VO/LSO can be used as conduit by the government sectoral departments (administrative pillar) and elected representatives (political pillar) with great advantage to enter into a partnership with the communities to tap their potential in implementing their services and supplies. Since government has the resources and permanent presence in the area, a formal linkages with community institutions not only supports the sustainability of the community institutions but also improve the government service delivery. During the last three years of SUCCESS, the RSPs have introduced the idea of Joint Development Committees (JDCs) at District and Taluka level to formalise the linkages between community institutions and government under the SUCCESS programme. These committees comprised membership from all the government line departments, elected representatives, representative of LSOs, representatives of RSPs and chaired by the Deputy Commissioner. The objective of JDCs is “to advocate for access to essential public services and for planning, implementation and monitoring of local development plans”. The JDCs, on their own, have been able to make little progress in this direction. The chairpersons, however, have been instrumental in motivating some of the line departments, which have entered into MOUs with RSPs. So far, various government departments have signed 23 MOUs for collaboration with RSPs and community institutions. Implementation of 21 activities across the 8 districts has started as a result of these MOUs. Most of these are one-off activities for specific purposes and have not engaged community institutions as expected in the stated objective.

**A number of steps could be considered for improving community-government linkages during the remainder of the project by the RSPs and the government. The actions required by the government are given under the section B, Policy level sustainability. These steps, listed below, can be taken by RSPs and LSOs, perhaps within the remaining duration of SUCCESS:**

- The RSPs could identify more line departments for entering into district-level MOUs and, over time, start discussing sector plans with them that are based on the community institutions’ village and union council plans.
- The RSPs could arrange regular orientation, training and exposure visits for JDC members to enhance their understanding of CDLD and its potential.
- The RSPs need a programme for building the capacity of VOs and LSOs for advocating and articulating their plans and priorities at JDCs and with individual line departments.
- The RSPs should develop a mechanism for digitalising the village and union council development plans and updating them annually.

**Seventh**, another key sustainability aspect is the enhanced capacities of RSPN and RSPs while implementing one of the largest CDD programme in Sindh. The standardisation of the process, learnings from policy work with government on PRS and CDLD policy, capacities enhanced in research, communication and advocacy during the project life will strengthen the RSPN and RSPs’ capacities that will remain with them beyond the project life.



**B. Policy level input for sustainability:** During the last three years through the SUCCESS TA component, the Government of Sindh has developed its Poverty Reduction Strategy (PRS) and CDLD Policy. It is the first time in Pakistan that a provincial government has recognised the social mobilisation approach of RSPs as a building block for poverty reduction and extend the social mobilisation approach to all rural districts of Sindh. The PRS and CDLD policy also endorse the idea of JDCs formed in the SUCCESS programme districts and aims to extend it to all districts in Sindh. However, as discussed in Section A, on JDCs at the policy level the following actions are needed for improving the effectiveness of the JDCs and its impact on sustainability.

The key challenge on the part of government is how to include community needs in the annual development planning process of the government and the district line department to deliver their services and supplies through the community institutions. The existing rules and procedures of government departments do not cater to the participation of community institutions in development planning and implementation processes. The second issue is the ownership of community institutions as an official partner in development. The third issue is limited human and financial capacity of line departments to engage with community institutions. Though the Poverty Reduction Strategy and CDLD policy approved by the government of Sindh adopts the JDC model of SUCCESS for all districts, there is a limited awareness about this document and policy at the district level.

The following important steps, which the TA Team and the Government of Sindh may consider for inclusion in the PRS/CDLD roadmap, are needed to make the JDCs – and linkages, more broadly – effective:

- selection of sectors and departments considered appropriate for partnership with community institutions and RSPs;
- identification of activities eligible for the proposed modality (or activities excluded from it);
- amendments in the Rules of Business and/or departmental policies and procedures to provide supplies and services of line departments through the community institutions;
- amendments in the district budget making rules and processes to include needs identified by community institutions through Village Development Plans and Union Council Development Plans;
- adequate (and possibly enhanced) pro poor resource allocation for priority sectors, departments and activities; and,
- provision for the minimum RSP field staff presence needed in each district for facilitating linkages with government departments, building the capacity of community institutions and government departments, and monitoring community institutions after the closure of SUCCESS.

Building upon the SUCCESS programme in the district of Tando Muhammad Khan, NRSP has taken the whole district to demonstrate what communities can do in achieving Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) as demonstrated by implementing of an initiative called Water, Immunisation, Sanitation and Education (WISE). This initiative is a partnership among relevant government department, NRSP and LSOs to improve some of the key SDG indicators and impact on poverty. The Chairman RSPN and CEOs of NRSP & SRSO advocated this to the Chief Secretary Sindh who showed willingness to make WISE an integral component of PPRP and SUCCESS. Action on this within the remaining time of SUCCESS or beyond will contribute to the sustainability of the programme significantly.

**C. Environmental sustainability:** The implementation manual and guidelines developed by RSPN reflect the necessary measures to be taken by RSPs to implement activities keeping in view the environmental concerns with no harm caused to the natural environment. Guidelines for environmental assessment for Community Infrastructure Projects are also

being used to determine whether a project activity is likely to have any environmental impact or it has the potential to cause adverse effects in any of its activities. For infrastructure projects, a mechanism has been designed which will ensure that community institutions will have sufficient funds with them for the operation and maintenance of completed schemes.

#### D. Financial sustainability

##### (i) Financial Sustainability of Community Institutions

**At the community level, the most important factor for financial sustainability of community institutions will be the CIF, which will be used by the community institutions as a revolving fund, which will continue to provide financial support to the community institutions, which is the key to sustainability of community Institutions.**

Interest or services charges on CIF loans will cover the following costs of the LSOs:

- Operating cost like salary of book keeper, CRPs, cost of stationery etc.
- Cost of losses if any
- Inflation cost to keep the real value of money intact.

In future as the LSOs and their work grows they may also charge membership fee from their member VOs and COs – in some LSOs in other part of the country membership fee has started and it also increase mutual and downward accountability of the LSOs to its members; pooling community savings and interest on savings can be another source and the LSOs can also generate funds through local donations and philanthropy.

##### (ii) Financial Sustainability of RSPs and RSPN

Beyond the SUCCESS programme life, the RSPs need to provide limited but ongoing technical support for continuation of the following key functions.

- a. Effective linkage between, RSPs, CIs and government department for incorporating community plans into government plans. This will require changes in government rules and procedures for including community plans into the government development planning process;
- b. Capacity building of CIs to articulate their priorities and needs in various government departmental/inter-department platforms;
- c. Capacity building of government officials on engaging with community institutions; and,
- d. Monitoring of the Community Investment Fund (CIF)
- e. Resource mobilisation from donors and other development partners to the LSOs with their changing needs.
- f. Ongoing leadership training to the existing and new community leaders in future
- g. Provision of technical information to communities through existing and new CRPs in future

**In order to address these requirements there is a need for the RSPs to maintain a small permanent field presence in each programme district. A sustainability grant/fund and/or permanent development partnership with the government will be needed for this purpose. The RSPs need to chalk out a plan for this in the remaining period of SUCCESS. This discussion is still ongoing amongst the RSPs i.e. at what level will this unit be and what costing will it have.**

At the RSPs Head Office level, the RSPs will continuously provide technical support to the district level teams in resource mobilisation, coordination with provincial and federal governments, designing and monitoring of projects and programme. RSPs have a core capacity based on their endowments.

At the RSPN level as it promotes a concept derived from over three decades of community-driven development experience across Pakistan, with a role of research, communications, backstopping, and advocacy of the RSPs work. The EU funding to RSPN will strengthen and broaden RSPN's effort to provide strategic support to RSPs for scaling up of community-driven local development in Sindh. Beyond the programme, RSPs will need limited but ongoing technical support for the continuation of similar nature of work. For that purpose, RSPN has a core capacity based on its endowment fund to continue the required strategic support to the RSPs.

---

### Annex – 3: Action Plan on SUCCESS MTR Recommendations

#### SUCCESS MTR Recommendations and RSP Feedback for Meeting with EU July 2019, RSPN (Updated on 30 September 2019)

S.#	MTR Recommendations	Comment/ Response from RSPN/RSPs	Action Taken / Proposed	Deadline <sup>3</sup>
1	EUD to reformulate the SUCCESS implementation plan for the remaining implementation period, with the following dimensions:	EU to Respond	Action to be taken by EU	
1(a)	Bring together the GoS and implementing partners to meet to consider these recommendations and agree actions;	EU to Respond	Action to be taken by EU	
1(b)	Keep women as the main beneficiaries but open economic Interventions (particularly TVST) more consistently to men;	Agreed	EU: How? Propose modification. RSPs: Detailed proposal on TVST component will be submitted in October 2019.	
1(c)	Define the support required by the GoS for the implementation of the PRS, including pilot RGC and Urban Clusters, by all implementing partners (both TA and RSPs);	RSPs are already supporting the CDLD policy of the PRS. It now depends on the GoS to define the RGC and Urban Clusters strategy. RSPs are currently busy in the implementation of CDLD policy and may consider its role in the scale up phase once the implementation of RGCs and urban cluster pilot is done.	RSPs: No action required by RSPs  EU: Ok Although investment in RGCs or other type of involvement could be an interest of some of the RSPs.	
1(d)	EUD Finance, Contracts and Audit Section to confirm that they are satisfied with the SUCCESS implementing partners' independent auditing arrangements.	EU to Respond. EU has already completed system audit of the RSPs/RSPN before the start of the programme and follow-up in 2018. The final audit is planned after completion of the programme. Annual expenditure verifications are regularly conducted by RSPN/RSPs as per the ToR given by EU and external audit firms mutually agreed by RSPs/RSPN and EU.	EU: Action to be taken by EU.  RSPs: RSPs are complying the agreement with EU. Additional actions by EU needs to be discussed and agreed with RSPs.	
1(e)	Consider, in conjunction with RSPs and GoS, moving direct accountability and oversight for RSPs to GoS.	The recommended comment is not clear. RSPs/RSPN have independent contract with EU. However, for oversight by GoS mechanism of high level Strategy and Policy Dialogue	EU: SPDC to take place on regular basis. District level ownership by Gov. to be increased by using existing district level platform. Report to DDC directly. Provincial level to notify district level on PRS and the role of the districts (not only on CDLD).	

<sup>3</sup> The deadlines will be set after meeting with EU.

S.#	MTR Recommendations	Comment/ Response from RSPN/RSPs	Action Taken / Proposed	Deadline <sup>3</sup>
		Committee (SPDC) chaired by the Chairperson P&D Board with membership of all provincial line department secretaries and representatives of RSPs is in place. In addition to this, there is an operational steering committee headed by PD PPRP in place. At district and Taluka level, Joint Development Committees (JDCs) chaired by the Deputy Commissioners and Assistant Commissioners is in place.	RSPs: RSPs are complying the agreement with EU. Additional actions by EU needs to be discussed and mutually agreed with RSPs	
2	GoS to strengthen institutional strategic and operational monitoring and oversight arrangements, such as to establish:		RSPs: RSPs are complying the agreement with EU. Additional actions by EU and GoS needs to be discussed and mutually agreed with RSPs.	
2(a)	A dedicated Committee for the implementation of PRS, to include monitoring of progress and mitigating risks;	GoS has to decide given the above existing committees	EUD: Unit and dedicated working group for M&E exists.	DONE
2(b)	A multi-stakeholder Partnership and Collaboration Framework for planning and coordinating the complex arrangements for managing PRS pilots;	As above	EUD: ?	
2(c)	A Technical Committee to oversee the implementation of the SUCCESS Interventions; and	As above	EUD: LDs to be invited to existing platforms. GoS+EUD to ensure that existing platforms meet frequently.	
2(d)	RSP-GoS MoU to promote greater direct interaction between RSPs and LDs.	Agreed	EUD: When is MoU going to be signed?  RSPs: RSPs have already signed 23 MoUs with various government line departments in the 8 programme districts to collaborate with RSPs and community institutions.	
3	TA team to further develop the PRS approach and Roadmap:	TA to respond	EUD: work is ongoing	
3(a)	Fully cost the PRS, include in the GoS' MTEF, and involve other donors to peer challenge the approach as well as seek financing;	GoS to respond	EUD: work is ongoing	
3(b)	Reconsider the timescales within the PRS to ensure they are realistic to allow	GoS to respond	EUD: Agreed, however timeframes should be redefined following completion of pilots to ensure realistic timeframes.	

S.#	MTR Recommendations	Comment/ Response from RSPN/RSPs	Action Taken / Proposed	Deadline <sup>3</sup>
	for likely slippage and junctures for reflection on the progress of pilots;			
3(c)	Plan for sustainability with RSPs and GoS: a. Establish impact and sustainability indicators for poverty reduction; b. Develop Sustainability Strategy post-SUCCESS; and c. Further develop Exit-handover Strategy post-SUCCESS.	a. For the RSPs component poverty and sustainability indicators are already built in the baseline and end line surveys. b. RSPN has already developed a draft sustainability strategy and exit strategy. It can further be improved after consultation with EU and GoS.	EUD: a) TA to develop poverty indicators in the context of M&E work for PRS b) RSP's draft sustainability and exit strategies to be shared and discussed with all partners RSPs: The draft sustainability strategy is attached at Annex – 2 and we would like to discuss it with all partners in the meeting planned on 21 October in Karachi.	
4	RSPs to reformulate the concept and approach of SM, in conjunction with the EUD and GoS to reduce its wholesale approach and become more targeted:	The whole SUCCESS programme is based on district wide coverage of social mobilisation and its effectiveness in poverty graduation programme is established. The recommendation here is neither clear nor the report provides any evidence to support this recommendation and its implication.	RSPs: Recommendation is not practical and not relevant given the programme design, progress made and lack of evidence on the findings and implication of the recommendation. The proposal for SUCCESS is based on tried and tested approaches of the RSPs. This includes targeting of the poorest with the poverty score card. The project has strong backing from the GOS, which has invested more funds in the expansion of this approach through the PPRP. Whereas improvements in the implementation of the approach are possible, the entire approach cannot be changed. Moreover, the MTR has recommended certain improvements in individual project components, which RSPs are addressing.	
4(a)	Reduce support to COs/VOs and increase support to LSOs (in particular, to increase their IMI) to enable LSOs to increase their level and quality of support to VOs/COs;	Recommendation is not practical and partly not relevant given the programme design, progress made so far and lack of evidence on the findings and the implication of the recommendation on the programme. The CO/VOs are the foundation of LSO without strengthening the foundation one cannot strengthen the LSOs. RSPs will continue its support to strengthen all tiers of institutions (CO/VO/LSO) with more focus on LSOs.	RSPs: RSPs will continue supporting all tiers of organisation with more emphasis on the institutional capacity building of the LSOs.  EUD: sustainability is created through the LSO platform/interface, which could play an important role in the future as entry point for 1) other interventions by sectors; 2) projects; 3) advocating for priorities etc. Support to LSOs need to increase.  RSPs: The strengthening of the three-tiered structure of community institutions is a process wherein the first step is to strengthen the COs then VOs and then LSOs. Currently, the RSPs are engaging LSOs more in managing the COs/VOs and interacting with the outside world. For example, LSOs representatives participate in JDC meetings, they participate in LSOs conventions and policy level dialogues, they manage CIF or monitor the CIF being managed by the VOs, forge linkages with governments and other projects, participate in health and education campaigns etc. Through all these	

S.#	MTR Recommendations	Comment/ Response from RSPN/RSPs	Action Taken / Proposed	Deadline <sup>3</sup>
			<p>interventions and processes, the LSOs have actually started playing the role of an apex organisation and are increasing their level and quality of support to VOs/COs. This means actions are already being taken. During the last year of the SUCCESS programme, the LSOs will start taking more responsibilities especially in conducting VOs/COs meetings. Additionally, refresher trainings and exposure visits to government line departments and inter-district LSO visits are being added in the work plan of year 5.</p>	
4(b)	<p>Design a strategic district-wide approach to SM, with ownership by GoS, including strengthening CI-GoS linkages, particularly in relation to improving access to and delivery of services, as per the PRS initiatives;</p>	<p>The social mobilisation approach is already district wide. It covers 70% households in the district.</p> <p>RSPs on their end are making efforts to link the CIs with service delivery department through bringing the voices of the CIs at JDCs and signing MoU with line department.</p> <p>However, for institutionalisation of delivering line department services through the CIs there is a need to change the rules of business of the government line departments. For this, the provincial government needs to facilitate this change at the policy level.</p>	<p>EUD: To be discussed with GoS on how to strengthen the linkages (dialogue to take place if rules of business need to be modified)</p> <p>RSPs: At the RSP level the social mobilisation is area specific, the consolidated UCDPs at district level do show the aspirations of the people. It is agreed that at the GoS level there is a need for the issuance of a clear notification asking all concerned departments e.g. social welfare, health, education, agriculture and livestock to utilise the forum of COs/VOs/LSOs as vehicles for the delivery of government services.</p>	
4(c)	<p>Prioritise the implementation of economic Interventions within the programme: IGG, CIF and TVST and strengthen their linkages to meet market demands;</p>	<p>Being followed by RSPs</p>	<p>EUD: How? Make a proposal/detail.</p> <p>RSPs: By design in the first two-years, mobilisation of communities and formation of the community institutions (COs/VOs/LSOs) was the priority because the implementation of the economic interventions (IGG, CIF, TVST) have to be implemented by these community institutions. In year 3 onwards the focus remained on implementation of the economic interventions (CIF, IGG, TVST). As of August 2019, 87% of CIF, 66% of IGG and 20% of TVST targets have been implemented.</p> <p>Currently RSPs identify the needs for IGG, CIF and TVST through consultation with potential beneficiaries, members of community institution and assess the local market at village level and UC level.</p>	

S.#	MTR Recommendations	Comment/ Response from RSPN/RSPs	Action Taken / Proposed	Deadline <sup>3</sup>
			To further strengthen linkages with market demand a market survey is added in the proposal for redesigning of TVST (Detailed proposal will be submitted in October 2019). The findings of the survey will also be used for CIF and IGG and MIPs will be reconciled with market survey. Additional resources are allocated for any value chain and enterprise interventions that maybe identified in the market survey.	
4(d)	Plan for sustainability with TA team and GoS: i. Establish impact and sustainability indicators for poverty reduction; ii. Develop Sustainability Strategy post-SUCCESS; and iii. Further develop Exit-handover Strategy post-SUCCESS.	a. For the RSPs component poverty and sustainability indicators are already built in the baseline and end line surveys. b. RSPN has already developed a draft sustainability strategy and exit strategy. It can further be improved after consultation with EU and GoS.	EUD: as per above for TA as well.	
5	EUD to reformulate the SUCCESS implementation plan, with the following dimensions:	EUD to respond	Action to be taken by EU	
5(a)	Prepare guidelines for implementing partners for engaging in political governance to increase cross-government support for the PRS;	EUD to respond	EUD: policy dialogue to take place on a regular basis with inputs from ALL partners.	
5(b)	Undertake an EU-commissioned Results Orientated Monitoring (ROM) to ensure effective programme re-planning has taken place;	EUD to respond	EUD: potentially to foresee ROM for last quarter of 2020.	
5(c)	Reallocate funds to LSOs to make them accountable for increasing the IMI of VOs /COs and promotion of: i. Access to primary education; ii. Female adult literacy and non-formal education; and iii. Liaison with Health Departments on maternal and child health services, immunisation and, improvements in child nutrition (PINS).	Providing access to primary education is the responsibility of the provincial government. The provincial government needs to issue clear guidelines to the district education department to work with LSOs to improve access to primary education. The RSPs are creating awareness among the communities to increase school enrolment and raise their voices at JDC meetings and to open closed school where applicable. As a result in some areas closed schools are opened and enrolments	EUD: RSPs to make a detailed proposal RSPs: A detailed proposal on the Adult Literacy component will be submitted in October 2019.	



S.#	MTR Recommendations	Comment/ Response from RSPN/RSPs	Action Taken / Proposed	Deadline <sup>3</sup>
		<p>have increased. This effort will continue in future as well.</p> <p>SEF is currently carrying out adult literacy programme in some districts and areas, RSPs are linking communities with the programme where possible. Female adult literacy programme requires additional financial resources. Actions will be taken after consultation with EU on availability of additional funds or review available budget for reallocation to adult literacy.</p> <p>The RSPs have signed MoUs with district health departments to increase immunisation and the PINS programme is already being implemented through the community institutions formed under SUCCESS. A notification from the provincial health department is needed to institutionalise the collaboration between district health departments and LSO for increasing outreach of health services.</p>		
5(d)	Require RSPN to report on the status of registration of CIs with the Social Welfare Department and Notification of CIs by the DCs separately (not combined);	Agreed	<p>EUD: when to expect first report? RSPs: Data available as of August 2019:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- 98% of VOs and 100% of LSOs notified by Deputy Commissioners</li> <li>- 1 LSO registered with Social Welfare Department</li> </ul>	
5(e)	Allocate additional funds to TA team to enable their fuller support to GoS in the implementation of the PRS.	EU to respond	EUD: work in progress	
6	GoS to continue to plan and drive the implementation of the PRS:	GoS to respond	Action to be taken by GoS	
6(a)	Establish cross-governmental GoS policy planning and technical coordination mechanisms (including LDs) to plan and monitor the progress of the implementation of the PRS;	GoS to respond	EUD: work in progress, implementation unit appointed, first technical teams in place	

S.#	MTR Recommendations	Comment/ Response from RSPN/RSPs	Action Taken / Proposed	Deadline <sup>3</sup>
6(b)	Lead joint GoS/TA/RSP/LSO/private sector teams to produce District profiles based on market research and economic analysis to identify local economic development opportunities within existing SUCCESS districts including RSP(RGC?) pilot sites;	GoS to respond	EUD: market analysis to be done also by RSPs to link to TVST (to be linked to economic district profiling by GoS – supported by TA) RSPs: Market survey will be included in the TVST proposal to be submitted in October 2019.	
6(c)	Continue to monitor the timescales within the PRS to ensure they are on track, and if not re-plan accordingly.	GoS to respond	EUD: as per above, see first implementation of pilots.	
7	TA team to continue to support the GoS in its implementation of the PRS Route Map, including to:	TA to respond	Action to be taken by GoS	
7(a)	Undertake comprehensive feasibility studies; costing of the proposed PRS initiatives; and documenting piloting processes and lessons learned; and	TA to respond	EUD: work in progress, to be continued during extension phase of TA	
7(b)	Support the integration of PRS in MTEF to provide budget allocations to districts and LDs with pro-poor criteria.	GoS to respond	EUD: to be discussed with GoS	
8	RSPs to continue to resolve ongoing barriers to local development including:			
8(a)	Bank accounts for all VOs;	Already being followed.	EUD: RSPs to provide latest state of play and details RSPs: 100% of LSOs and 71% of VOs formed so far have opened bank accounts. For the rest, work is in progress.	
8(b)	Registration of CIs, particularly LSOs, with Social Welfare Department to acquire funding;	There are advantages to registering a CI, making it a legal entity. However, this will not enable the LSOs to acquire funding as the MTR suggests. In the current environment, accessing local and foreign funding is difficult due to limited resources, other regulations and limited technical capacities for funding.  In addition the objective of fostering community institutions is not to make them NGOs for accessing funding rather creating a service delivery accountability mechanism to access public resources and a platform to bridge the gap between	RSPs: Currently there are following practical challenges for registration of Community Institutions: 1. The current Social Welfare laws are made for registration of professional NGOs and not meant for community institutions made by poor communities 2. The registration requires a one-time fee of Rs. 10,000 and annual renewal fee of Rs. 2000 3. The registration process requires lengthy documentation process All these requirements are additional burden on the poor communities. RSPs are continuously motivating the LSOs to register themselves with SWD but the decision is upon LSOs themselves.  However, RSPs have taken this issue with EU and government of Sindh, and continue to advocate for bringing a new	

S.#	MTR Recommendations	Comment/ Response from RSPN/RSPs	Action Taken / Proposed	Deadline <sup>3</sup>
		government services and poor communities.	registration law or make amendments to the existing SWD laws under the CDLD policy that are community institutions friendly. EUD: to further discuss with GoS	
8(c)	Institutionalise CRPs within LSOs and seek funding from other donors who use their services;	Agreed. This is in fact part of the design of the project and not a recommendation as such.	EUD: How, please give details. RSPs: The CRPs are identified, selected and hired by the LSOs. RSPs are promoting the use of CRPs trained under SUCCESS by other projects keeping the existing workload and availability of CRPs. Examples are available where CRPs were engaged by government departments for the polio and immunisation campaign. In District Sujawal the election commission engaged some of the CRPs to facilitate the election process in the villages.  The RSPs have also engaged some of the CRPs in other donor projects. For example, legal empowerment and education empowerment projects funded by Open Foundation Society, family planning project funded by PSI and WISE programme of NRSP. In some areas where it is difficult to find CRPs, the SUCCESS CRPs also work for the PINS project.	
8(d)	Support strengthening of GoS role in implementing CDLD policy and practice: i. Support fund allocations from the province, strengthen powers, and accountability of the JDC to local communities; and ii. Provide shared access of all key stakeholders (including GoS) to the RSPs' M&E system.	i. The RSP not only support but advocate for fund allocation from provinces to line department to strengthen the JDCs. ii. All progress on KPIs is available online through the SUCCESS dashboard, all M&E frameworks are available on the SUCCESS website and M&E reports are regularly shared with all stakeholders	EUD: to specify how to do it differently, to ensure JDCs are successful. Shall current existing structures be used? RSPN: The following changes are needed on the supply side to make the JDCs more effective: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Amendment in the Rules of Business and/or departmental policies and procedures to provide supplies and services of line departments through the community institutions.</li> <li>• Amendments in the district budget making rules and process to include needs identified by community institutions through Village Development Plans, and Union Council Development Plans. And include the LSO representatives in District Development Committees.</li> <li>• The chairpersons (Deputy Commissioners and Assistant Commissioners) take the ownership of the JDCs as government structure and ensure the meetings of the JDC take place or may allow the JDCs to meet on their own on a regular basis, select a moderator for each meeting and provide the minutes of the meeting for vetting and formal approval by the chairperson.</li> </ul>	

S.#	MTR Recommendations	Comment/ Response from RSPN/RSPs	Action Taken / Proposed	Deadline <sup>3</sup>
			EUD (ii) Availability noted, but what about access? Does all GoS have access to the website? The website is publically accessible and updates are regularly shared with officials through emails	
8(e)	Address barriers to women's empowerment: ensure women receive literacy and numeracy education, through linkages with the Education department and/or CSOs for example.	Sindh Education Foundation (SEF) is currently carrying out adult literacy programme in some areas, RSPs are linking communities with the programme where possible. Actions will be taken after consultation with EU on availability of additional fund or review of budget for reallocation to adult literacy programme	EUD: kindly make a proposal RSPs: Proposal will be submitted in October 2019	
9	RSPs to introduce costed improvements to Interventions, in discussion with EUD and GoS, which may include:			
9(a)	<p>Improve efficiency and transparency of administration of Interventions:</p> <p>i. All RSPs to buy-in local economic development know-how to improve IGGs, CIFs, CPIs, and TVST Interventions;</p> <p>ii. Streamline and simplify Interventions' bureaucracy and rules of application; and</p> <p>iii. Establish a CI grievance redressal mechanism in relation to their interactions and transactions with the RSPs;</p> <p>iv. Promote and reward innovation and sustainability measures within the (re)design and implementation of Interventions; and</p> <p>v. Develop an open online platform for knowledge management and learning amongst RSPs.</p>	<p>(i) Agreed.</p> <p>(ii) This recommendation is not clear. The process that RSPs adopt prior, during and after delivery of these services i.e. IGG, CIF, TVST interventions is such that it enhances the capacities of RSPs staff as well as the communities. It helps increase knowledge of both, in local economic development know-how. This process includes baseline surveys, market surveys, PSC, MIPs, VDPs, UCDPs, handholding of beneficiaries through CRPs and office bearers of LSOs/VOs, participation and support in procurement of business assets from IGG and CIF etc.</p> <p>(iii), RSPs do have grievance redressal mechanism in place which will be reviewed and further strengthened.</p> <p>(iv) agreed</p> <p>(v) The RSPs have online and other platforms such as annual strategy</p>	<p>EUD: ii) we have discussed during operational meetings some of the internal procedures within RSPs, that could be revised and simplified. Kindly look into these matters.</p> <p>iii) please specify the how</p> <p>iv) kindly submit proposal on how</p> <p>v) the question is, is learning functioning at the moment or not? Are there ways to improve? Based on several discussions cross-fertilization should take place regularly.</p> <p>RSPs:</p> <p>(i) Agreed. In the redesigning of TVST component additional resources allocated for market survey and relevant human resources for value chain, enterprise development and market linkages.</p> <p>(iii) The RSPs work with Community Institutions (CIs) is based on a development partnership. After formation of the CI, the RSP and CI sign a term of partnership which clearly defines the roles and responsibilities of each partner. The CIs meet on monthly basis and share their feedback and grievance with RSPs. The RSPs hold activist workshop on quarterly basis where the community activists give their feedback and share grievances with the RSP management at district level. In addition to this there is complaint registration mechanism in place for example the details of NRSP complain and investigation guidelines are available at <a href="http://nrsp.org.pk/complaints.html">http://nrsp.org.pk/complaints.html</a></p>	

S.#	MTR Recommendations	Comment/ Response from RSPN/RSPs	Action Taken / Proposed	Deadline <sup>3</sup>
		retreat, LSO conventions, sectoral resource groups, and annual lessons learning workshop and visits for knowledge management and sharing amongst RSPs.	(iv) SUCCESS design incorporates several aspects of sustainability, including financial, institutional, policy level and environmental sustainability. The sustainability plan and proposed actions are attached in Annex 2. (v) All the platforms mentioned in the comments section are functioning. Learnings and experience of RSPs and communities are discussed and shared for cross fertilisation. It is the result of these learnings that RSPs programmes and approaches have evolved over time and programme design has improved.	
9(b)	<p>IGG:</p> <p>i. Include economic indicators for eligibility, such as employment generation, household income composition, cost-benefit calculations, and access to markets;</p> <p>ii. Increase the value of the IGG to a minimum of PKR 20,000;</p> <p>iii. Review repayment modes; and</p> <p>iv. Link the most vulnerable households to BISP, Bait-ul-mal and/or Zakat schemes.</p>	<p>(i) Agreed</p> <p>(ii) The amount depends on the need, capacity and viability of the proposed intervention by the beneficiary in their MIPs, and therefore, a minimum or maximum amount cannot be set. However, the average amount can be increased given the current inflation.</p> <p>(iii) IGG is a one-time grant and there is no repayment.</p> <p>(iv) BISP, PBP and Zakat have their own process of selecting beneficiaries and RSPs cannot change their process. RSPs can only create awareness in the community about these organisations and link the organisations with communities. Awareness about BISP, Zakat and PBM will be raised among communities. Efforts will be made to sign MoUs with Zakat, BISP and PBM departments for creating linkages with CIs and JDCs (where they will be requested to become members).</p>	<p>EUD: i) kindly provide details; RSPs: The eligibility criteria include the PSC which is based on economic indicators. This is followed by the development of micro investment plan by the beneficiaries. Appraisal of the MIP by RSP technical staff includes income, employability criteria of the proposed intervention by the beneficiaries. In addition, RSPN is planning to conduct an assessment of the IGG beneficiaries in 2020 which will include cost benefit and efficiency analysis. The ToR for this will be available by the first quarter of 2020.</p> <p>EUD: iii) indeed; iv) this is what the recommendation is about, please be specific however on what you communicate with BISP and Bait-ul-mal or Zakat.</p> <p>RSPs:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- The RSPs organise quarterly activist workshops for the community institutions representatives. Representatives of Zakat and Bait-ul-mal will be invited to these workshops where they explain their programmes and how the communities can benefit from them. Community institutions' representatives will interact with them directly at this platform.</li> <li>- The district social welfare officer is already a member of the JDC. The JDC chairpersons will be requested to also include district Bait-ul-mal and Zakat heads in the JDC meetings where the LSO representatives can interact with them and share information on the poorest households for support.</li> <li>- RSPs will make efforts to sign MoUs with Bait-ul-mal and Zakat departments to collaborate in implementation of activities through the CIs.</li> </ul>	

S.#	MTR Recommendations	Comment/ Response from RSPN/RSPs	Action Taken / Proposed	Deadline <sup>3</sup>
9(c)	<p>CIF:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>i. Increase the value of the CIF to a minimum of PKR 20,000;</li> <li>ii. Review repayment modes;</li> <li>iii. Address the sustainability of the revolving ICF;</li> <li>iv. Allow progression from IGG to CIF;</li> <li>v. Provide support to micro/small business development;</li> <li>vi. Link CIF with an approach to Access to Finance; and</li> <li>vii. Link CIF to TVST.</li> </ul>	<p>Except for point (i), the rest of the points are part of the existing CIF design.</p>	<p>EUD: i) to provide more details on why higher amount would not be possible. iii-vii) please provide details on how</p> <p>RSPs: The amount can be increased but cannot be kept at a minimum of Rs. 20,000 because for example if someone needs Rs. 10,000 how can one force someone to take a loan of Rs. 20,000? The loan size from CIF is determined by the VOs/LSOs based on the ability of the CIF beneficiary managing an enterprise/livestock, her repayment capacity and repayment character. However, LSOs/VOs will be clarified that they need not fix an artificial lower ceiling and in bona fide cases they can give even the first loan in the amount of Rs 20,000.</p> <p>The repayment mode is decided by the LSO in consultation with the beneficiaries based on the nature and size of the loan and repayment capacity of the beneficiary.</p> <p>The poorest households who got IGG first time and wanted to get a loan from CIF are allowed to get CIF after one year depending on the demand and needs of the beneficiary. This type of progression is already happening. Currently 259 beneficiaries have got CIF. On the other hand, the MFIs do not use PSC for targeting rather they check credit history. As a result of this approach, there is greater scope for the CIF beneficiaries to access finance from MFIs based on their credit history of CIF loans. The PMN reports show that there is a growing trend of increasing microfinance portfolio in the SUCCESS districts which shows a link and progression is already happening. Additionally, CIF is by design an approach and instrument for access to finance for the poor on sustainable basis.</p> <p>TVST beneficiaries who need CIF are being linked with CIF and vice versa. Currently 6368 TVST beneficiaries have got CIF.</p>	
9(d)	<p>TVST:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>i. Redesign the TVST to be market driven and increase market linkages in each district through:</li> </ul>	<p>The market driven approach on its own cannot be used as the target group (poor, women) would not be able to meet the requirements. The market driven approach is still</p>	<p>EUD: kindly submit proposal before operational meeting RSPs: Detailed proposal will be submitted in October 2019</p>	

S.#	MTR Recommendations	Comment/ Response from RSPN/RSPs	Action Taken / Proposed	Deadline <sup>3</sup>
	<p>a. Demand side market assessment surveys;</p> <p>b. Establish viable linkages with the private sector; and</p> <p>c. Need assessment surveys on the supply side to impart the skills required according to the market demand.</p> <p>ii. Track the trainees periodically in order to identify the kind of training that leads to a high degree of employment or self-employment. Course corrections may be indicated in view of this exercise;</p> <p>iii. Review the experiences of other projects working with the same target group as SUCCESS;</p> <p>iv. Ensure a coordinated effort among the RSPs to align TVST more strongly with its objectives;</p> <p>v. Provide support to micro/small business development;</p> <p>vi. Provide support for Access to Finance for micro and small businesses;</p> <p>vii. Ensure courses are certified as recognised by local/regional employers and re-cost accordingly;</p> <p>viii. Promote non-traditional skills training for women; and</p> <p>ix. Avoid local neighbourhood market saturation with same-skills training (e.g. sewing).</p>	<p>assumption-based without assessing the available markets so changing the overall approach is not practical.</p> <p>Also the evidence provided by the MTR survey, shows that 66% of the beneficiaries are self-employed and 7% are employed in the public and private sector and incomes of the beneficiaries has increased significantly. The RSPs agree to redesign the TVST component given the available information and its implication on the target group.</p> <p>A mixed approach can be undertaken to include both “market driven” and the current “community driven” approaches. Community driven approach is based on the local area mapping for market opportunities and the needs identified by the representatives of grassroots community organisations. The market approach will have to be started on a smaller scale, to assess its effectiveness.</p> <p>The RSPs will prepare a concept note and share with EU for approval and subsequent amendment in the contract.</p>		
9(e)	<p>MHI:</p> <p>i. Hold dialogue with MHI scheme bearers to seek to increase panel hospitals and range of treatments and diagnostic tests covered;</p> <p>ii. Introduce and institutionalise feedback mechanism on quality of treatment and service received by beneficiaries; and</p>	(i) This recommendation is not relevant to MHI scheme bearers (beneficiaries) rather to Insurance Company.	<p>RSPs:</p> <p>(i) There is general lack of availability of hospitals providing quality services within the programme districts. All hospitals meeting the eligibility criteria of panel hospitals have been included and diagnostic tests are already covered.</p> <p>ii) A study on MHI has recently been conducted by RSPN that includes feedback from MHI beneficiaries. The CRPs are taking regular feedback from MHI beneficiaries on monthly meeting of community institutions and the feedback is being reviewed at the month review meeting of CRPs with issues</p>	

S.#	MTR Recommendations	Comment/ Response from RSPN/RSPs	Action Taken / Proposed	Deadline <sup>3</sup>
	iii. Cover transport costs where access is prohibitive due to distance.		<p>communicated to hospitals, insurance company and relevant RSP staff.</p> <p>(iii) Transportation cost have been included as part of the insurance coverage.</p> <p>EUD: i) hospitals in nearest districts/cities? RSPs: Hospitals available in the cities and district headquarters are already on the panel, the issue is finding hospitals in sub-district level.</p> <p>EUD: (ii-iii) noted.</p>	
10	RSPN to undertake an end of SUCCESS Programme Poverty Impact Assessment including an end-study and survey assessing: Interventions impact on poverty; stakeholders'/beneficiaries' satisfaction with PRS initiatives; and identification of lessons learned.	RSPN has already planned impact assessment of the RSPs component of SUCCESS. The PRS initiatives are beyond its scope.	Impact Assessment is planned in the last year of the programme.	
11	GoS to continue to implement the PRS:	GoS to respond	Action to be taken by GoS EUD: point 11 to be discussed with GoS	
11(a)	Introduce a more comprehensive measurement of Poverty to include relevant dimensions such as: indebtedness, dependencies on powerful local landlords, and accessible marketing opportunities, which determine the poverty situation particular to landless rural households;	GoS to respond	Action to be taken by GoS	
11(b)	Identify potential private sector and CSO (may include LSOs) partners for future Rural Support Programme;	GoS to respond	Action to be taken by GoS	
11(c)	Continue to focus on improvement of service delivery (volume, access and quality); and good governance, including: devolution, public financial management, inclusiveness, responsiveness, transparency and accountability.	GoS to respond	Action to be taken by GoS	
12	EUD to consider as part of the formulation of the new Rural Support Programme:	GoS to respond	Action to be taken by GoS	



S.#	MTR Recommendations	Comment/ Response from RSPN/RSPs	Action Taken / Proposed	Deadline <sup>3</sup>
12(a)	Increase support to Livelihoods, and redesign/introduce new, costed Interventions including: job creation; meeting market demand; business start-up support; and learning from Livelihood programmes in Pakistan and elsewhere; and	GoS to respond	EUD: support to livelihoods will be increased, programme will focus on service delivery and its means.	
12(b)	Promote environmental protection and resource management, including disaster risk reduction, water resource and soil protection as well as renewable energy that would be available through appropriate technologies.	GoS to respond	EUD: to be discussed with GoS	

---